ABUSE IN CARE ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY MĀORI HEARING

Under The Inquiries Act 2013

In the matter of The Royal Commission of Inquiry into Historical Abuse in

State Care and in the Care of Faith-based Institutions

Royal Commission: Ms Julia Steenson

Dr Anaru Erueti Mr Paul Gibson Judge Coral Shaw

Ali'imuamua Sandra Alofivae

Counsel: Ms Julia Spelman, Mr Kingi Snelgar, Mr Wiremu Rikihana,

Mr Luke Claasen, Ms Maia Wikaira, Ms Alisha Castle,

Ms Tracey Norton, Ms Season-Mary Downs, Ms Alana Thomas, Mr Winston McCarthy,

Mr Simon Mount QC,

Ms Kerryn Beaton QC for the Royal Commission

Ms Melanie Baker, Ms Julia White and Mr Max Clarke-Parker for the Crown Mr James Meagher for the Catholic Church Ms Fiona Guy Kidd for the Anglican Church

Ms Sonya Cooper, Ms Amanda Hill as other counsel

attending

Venue: Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei Tumutumuwhenua Marae

59b Kitemoana Road

Ōrākei

AUCKLAND

Date: 18 March 2022

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

INDEX

EXPERT PANEL – MODERATED BY TRACEY McINTOSH DENISE MESSITER, HERA CLARKE, PAORA MOYLE, TUPUA URLICH AND GARY WILLIAMS	720
CLOSING STATEMENT BY THE CROWN	756
CLOSING STATEMENT BY THE ROYAL COMMISSION	758

[9.54 am]

32

33

1 2 **KAUMĀTUA TAIAHA:** E Tū e, e Tū e. Tū ka riri, Tū ka nguha. Tutū tū parerē, tutū pā kōkota. 3 Ka kotā ki whea? Ka koko ki raro i aku taha. Tū te winiwini, tū te wanawana. Kā maru a Tū ki te rangi. Ki te whakarongo mai ki taku hau tauā. He tauā, he tauā. Piri papa te hoe, awhi 4 5 papa te hoe. Toitū te hoe, toi rere te hoe. Toi mahuta te hoe e runga i te rangi. Hāpai ake au ki te kakau o taku hoe. Ki te Māhūhū ki te rangi, whiti pāta tō hoe. Māmā papa to hoe. 6 Rongo papa tō hoe, kia kaha ko te wai o taku hui e, ue, ue, hi! 7 [English: stand, stand tall. It is Tū the angry, Tū the war God, he stands to my side, Tū te 8 winiwini, Tū te wanawana, who stands tall to the sky. Harken to the wind, winds of war, 9 the oar is held sternly and stands tall to the sky, lifted above, my oar, my sacred oar, Te 10 Mahuhu ki te Rangi.] 11 Whakawhiti te moana a Rehia, te puaha o Manukau, Te Kupenga o Taramainuku, Te Toka 12 tapu a Kupe. Kei raro rā i ngā parirau o Kāhu pōkere o Tāmaki e. Ko Te Puru o Tāmaki e 13 ngunguru nei, au, au auē hā. Ko Ngāti Whātua e ngunguru nei, au, au, auē hā! Ko Te Puru o 14 Tāmaki e ngunguru nei, au, au, auē hā! 15 [English: The ocean is traversed, the entrance of Manuka, the constellation of Te Kupenga 16 o Taramainuku. Below are the wings of the sacred hawk of Tāmaki, of Te Puru o Tamaki 17 who proceeds forth. It is Ngāti Whātua who proceeds forth. It is Te Puru o Tāmaki who 18 proceeds forth.] 19 20 E ngā mātāwaka, tēnei te reo o Tumutumuwhenua e karanga pēnei ana ki a koutou, nau mai, piki mai, kake mai, tau, tau, tau mai te mauri a tā tātou nei hui. 21 [English: To all the many sacred canoes, this is the voice of Tumutumuwhenua welcoming, 22 welcome, welcome and let the life force of this gather be settled on us all.] 23 Nau mai ki te rā whakamutunga o tēnei kaupapa kua rewa i roto i ngā wiki e rua. He aroha 24 nui tēnei ki a koutou e aku rangatira. Ahakoa, kāre taea e koutou te haramai ki tēnei marae 25 a tinana, kia whārikihia ngā kōrero. Kia matua mōhio koutou, nā runga i te mate korona, 26 kei te pērā. Ehara i te mea, kua kati ngā kuaha ō tēnei whare ki a koutou. Ehara i te mea, 27 kāre e whāriki te manaakitanga o Ngāti Whātua ki runga i a koutou. Ehara i te mea, kāre 28 mātou e karanga i a koutou i roto i tērā reo aroha, te reo pōhiri i roto i ngā rā kua pahure. E 29 kore e pērā, e kore e pērā. 30 31

[English: Welcome to this our last day of our inquiry that has been held over the two weeks. Our thoughts go out to you all that could not attend to present your evidence, and may it be known, it was only through the coronavirus that it is like that. It is not as if my doors are closed to you, it is not as if our manaakitanga is not here for you, it is not as if we banish our love from this house in the days that have gone by.]

1 2

Nā reira, tēnei tāku ki te motu. Kia tau, kia tau, kia tau ki runga i te ngākau aroha. Kia tau ki runga i te pono me te tika i a tātou e tāwharautia tēnei hāpori i tērā o ngā mate anuanu e patu nei i a mātou katoa. Nā reira, tēnā pae, hei roto i ngā rā he wā anō kia haramai koutou ki runga i a Rākeiiriora. Kei reira tāu tūtaki ai a tinana. Kei reira tāua e hongi, i tērā wairua o ngā mātua, o ngā tūpuna. Engari mō te tēnei wā. Kia waiho mā te hui topa, tēnei hei whakatutuki i ngā kaupapa kei waenganui i a tāua, kei roto i te rangimārie.

[English: Therefore, I would like to say this to the country, to everyone, that love, understanding be based on these facts pertaining to this virus that harms all of us. Perhaps in the coming days you can attend in person where we will meet in person to hongi within the spirit of our ancestors. But in this time we will leave it for our online communications for these presentations to take place.]

Kei roto i te aroha. Kia tau ngā tauwhirotanga o Ihoa o ngā mano ki runga i a koutou katoa, kia piki te ora, kia piki te kaha, kia piki te māramatanga me te aroha ki runga i a koutou, ki runga i a mātou, ki runga i a tātou katoa. Koutou, ngā kaikōrero mō tēnei rā, kia kaha, kia māia, kia manawanui. Ko tēnei te mihi, ko tēnei te tangi, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, he wai.

[English: Therefore, blessings of God be bestowed upon you all with great strength and love to you and to us here. To the people giving their testimonies today, be stouthearted, be strong, I acknowledge you all. A song please.]

(Waiata: He aha te hau e wawara mai. He tiu, he raki, nāna i ā mai te pūpū tarakihi ki uta. E tīkina atu e au ki te kōtiu. Kōia te pou, te pou whakairo ka tū ki Waitematā I ōku wairangi e, kōkiri!)

[English: what is that murmuring sound upon the north wind that cast my paper nautilus to shore, which I plucked from the north wind and thus claimed, it is the carved pillar that stands in the Waitematā harbour that I see in my distressed state. What is that murmuring sound upon the north wind that cast my paper nautilus ashore, which I plucked from the north wind and thus claimed, it is the carved pillar that stands in the Waitematā harbour that I see in my distressed state.]

Tērā kōrero anō i waihotia mai e ngā mātua, e ngā tūpuna. E ngā mate, haere.Haere ki Hawaiki nui, Hawaiki roa, Hawaiki pāmamao, i roto o Hawaiki tapu. Moe mai koutou, i roto i te aroha me te rangimārie. Moe mai koutou i roto i te Ariki. Māna koutou katoa e whakaokioki. Māna koutou katoa e whakaokioki. E tātou ngā waihotanga mai o ngā mātua o ngā tūpuna. Tēnei tikanga, e rere nei ki waenganui i a tāua i tēnei wā. Waiho mā tērā e

paiheretia nei e tāua ki te tika me te pono. Ahakoa te āhuatanga o te mate korona, he wā anō kia whakatutuki tēnei o ngā tūtakitanga i roto i tā tāua tikanga. Nā reira, kia tau te rangimārie ki runga i a tātou katoa. Tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, tēnā rā tātou katoa.

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2425

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

[English: And in finishing, I would like to acknowledge and farewell our dearly departed who have wend their way to Hawaiki. Sleep, rest on, rest in peace with the Lord. To us the remnants of those who have departed, let these presentations be the tie between all of us, regardless of the impacts of the coronavirus. May peace be upon all, thank you.] **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā koutou katoa. Ko te mihi tuatahi, ki te kaikaraki, nāna te mana o te karakia i kawe i tēnei rā. Kei te mihi ki te moana e hora nei. Ko te Waitematā e karapoti nei i te Motutapu me te Rangi i toto ai te ihu. Ko Takaparawhau te whenua tapu I porotēhi ai, kia tūtū ai te puehu. Takoto mai, takoto mai rā. E te whare Tumutumuwhenua, tū tonu mai, tū tonu mai. Kā poroporoakitia ki ngā mate. Koutou kua wehe atu ki te pō, haere, haere, haere. Kei maumaharatia mātou, tō tātou matua, Tā Wira Gardiner. E te rangatira, haere atu ki te pō, haere at, haere, haere, haere. [English: acknowledgments to all, I would like to greet and salute our minister today. So to the sea that flows below Waitemata, also to the island Rangitoto, to the sacred land Takaparawhau where protests were held and efforts to keep the land, Tumutumuwhenua, the ancestral house, stand tall. I'd also like to support and farewell our dearly departed, farewell. We remember you Sir Wira Gardiner, farewell, farewell, rest on.] Hoki mai ki a mātou ki ngā kanohi ora. Kia a koutou kua tae mai ki te tautoko te kaupapa o te rā, tēnā koutou katoa. Ngāti Whātua ki Ōrākei, te mana, te wehi, te ihi, tēnā koutou tēnā koutou me manaakitanga. E mihi ana ki a koutou katoa, ngā purapura ora, koutou i whakauru mai, koutou e mātakitaki mai ana, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou katoa.

[English: Coming back to the living, to our survivors, I acknowledge you all, also to Ngāti Whātua ki Ōrākei, the power and prestige of this place, salutations. I would like to acknowledge you, once again, the survivors who tuned in and who gave their testimonies.]

Ko Anaru Erueti ahau. he Kaikōmihana mō te Inquiry. Nō Taranaki ahau. He uri nō te waka o Aotea. Ko Taranaki te maunga, Ko Ngā Ruahinerangi te iwi. Ko Ngārongo te marae. Nō reira, tēnā koutou katoa.

[English: My name is Anaru Erueti, I am a Commissioner of this Inquiry, I am from Taranaki, from Aotea waka, Taranaki is the mountain, Ngā Ruahine is the tribe, Ngārongo is the marae. Greeting to you all]

Welcome everyone, I want to acknowledge the karakia and waiata from Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei, tēnā koe and to welcome you all back here to our last day, day 10 of our inquiry. It's very exciting for us to be here. I'm here at the table with my colleagues from the Inquiry, Julia Steenson to my left here and also Paora Gibson, our fellow Commissioners, so three at the tēpu today. And I want to acknowledge to our fellow Commissioners, Sandra Alofivae and the Chair of the Inquiry, Coral Shaw, who are also participating via AVL.

1 2

Before we start we want to recognise the others who are joining us by AVL too. They are the members of our Survivor Advisory Group, tēnā koutou, they've been watching each day closely; the members of our Māori advisory rōpū, Te Taumata, tēnā koutou. We also have the Crown who has been watching each day and you out there, our people from Aotearoa who have been following the events as well.

So important for this Inquiry to ensure that we have access to those with disabilities, for example we have our signers here who are signing each day, we also have our interpreters for te reo Māori who are able to feed into our signers, tēnā kōrua, and our stenographer who's here each day transcribing for us. I want to mihi also to our tech team, our Māori investigation team, our Māori lawyers who have been supporting us over the last two weeks.

But let's turn now to our panel today. We've been waiting and looking forward to the session this morning. We have our panel of which are going to be led by Professor Tracey McIntosh of the University of Auckland.

Kei te mihi ki a koutou. Nau mai, haere mai me tō whānau ki tēnei uiuinga. Tēnā hoki mai, me tō haere mai ki te takoha i ō kōrero ki a mātou. E mihi ana ki a koutou, me tō whakaurunga ki tēnei uiuinga i tēnei rā.

[English: I acknowledge you all, welcome, along with your family to this Inquiry to give your contributions to us. Thank you for your entry to this proceeding today.]

If we could turn to our panel is chaired by Tracey, tēnā koe Tracey, kei te mihi atu ki a koe [English: thank you Tracey, I acknowledge you.] I'll leave it to you, Tracey, to introduce our panel members. We have Denise Messiter, we have Hera Clarke, Paora Moyle, Tupua Urlich and, of course, Matua Gary Williams all here participating in our panel today. Nga mihi mahana ki a koutou katoa [English: warm welcome to you all.]

EXPERT PANEL

PROF McINTOSH: E ngā mana whenua, Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei, tēnā koutou. E te kaiwhakarite i a tātou, tēnā koe, Taiaha. Mauri ora ki a koutou. E ngā iwi, ki ngā hapū, e ngā mana e pupuri mai nei te mana Māori, tēnā rā koutou. E ngā rangatira, tēnā tātou katoa. Ko [English: to the mana whenua Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei, to you Taiaha salutations.

1	Also greetings to everyone who holds on to the prestige of the Māori people,
2	acknowledgments to you all.]
3	Ko wai au? Ko Mataatua te waka, ko Tamaroa-ki-te-kōrero te tangata, ko Ōtenuku te
4	whenua, ko Ōtenuku te papakāinga, ko Ōtenuku te marae. Ko Ngāti Koura te hapū, ko
5	Tūhoe te iwi. Ko Tracey McIntosh tēnei.
6	[English: Mataatua is the canoe, Tamaroa ki te Korero is the man, Ōtenuku is the ancestral
7	land and Ōtenuku is the marae, Ngāti Koura is the hapū, Tūhoe is the tribe. My name is
8	Tracey McIntosh.]
9	I just want to acknowledge, as has already been acknowledged, the passing of Ta
10	Wira Gardiner and a recognition of a lifetime of work for our people. Moe rā, moe rā, moe
11	rā (sleep, sleep, rest on).
12	These last two weeks we have been in the presence of profound truth. We have
13	been in the presence of what it means to sit in spaces where there is a need for profound
14	honesty. We have listened, we have listened deeply. To tamariki, those that were children
15	who were not protected, who were not heard, who were rendered invisible and who were
16	removed and when they were able to speak of their pain, they were not believed. This form
17	of State and civil indifference, inattention and harm must be redressed and this is what this
18	Māori hearing is about.
19	For those who were children, about being put into places that not only do not care
20	for you or heal you, but that actively harm, and for far too often harm in ways that have
21	incredible intergenerational reach. We have heard of multiple sites of violence. We have
22	heard about State violence and State abuse. We have heard about enforced loneliness, a
23	separation and a severing of whakapapa, a removal from whakapapa that could nurture and
24	heal. We have heard of enslavement; and I use this word carefully and with due
25	consideration of the weight of its meaning.
26	In listening to what has been said we recognise the conditions of systemic abuse on
27	tamariki Māori where they've been subject to and enforced to an enduring harm,
28	characterised by the loss of autonomy and in too many cases the complete disregard to their
29	bodily, spiritual, collective and cultural sovereignty. There's been a haunting over the last

30

31

32

33

34

Today I have this real honour of facilitating this incredible panel, of people with such expertise, including that of deep learned experience, I want to mihi to all of them. I'm

two weeks, but we can no longer ghost those who have not been heard. We recognise those

who still remain silent, we recognise those who have been silenced, and we are very aware

of those who have passed, whose silence has echoed through us over these last two weeks.

so honoured to be here and playing the small role that I will be playing over the course of this morning.

1 2

So I will introduce, give a brief introduction for all of these people. I could spend all of the time speaking of their achievements, their love for our people, their love for our people and the love for the mokos that are yet to come, and that recognition of that power of mokopunatanga. I mihi to all of them.

We have Paora Moyle, Ngāti Porou who is a survivor of both State and faith-based abuse, and has at least 30 years of giving, of drawing on that experience to help others. She was the lead claimant in the Waitangi Tribunal Oranga Tamariki Inquiry and her work continues in so many ways; including working towards a doctorate in child trauma in State care. Selflessly Paora has used her lived experience to support other survivor whānau. She was also one of the authors of the 2021 Hāhā-uri Hāhā-tea Māori Involvement in State Care 1950-1990 report. Ngā mihi Paora.

The honour of having wonderful Matua Gary Williams with us today. Again, a lifetime of leadership, of driving transformative change for disabled people and for Māori katoa. He is a proud trustee of Ngā Hau e Whā national marae in Ōtautahi, works strongly in the NGO sector, and Gary is a member of the Royal Commission Survivor Advisory Group of experts. Tēnā koe Gary.

We have Tupua Urlich, Ngāti Kahungungu ki Heretaunga, the first to speak at these hearings. Tupua is a survivor who was in State care from the age of 5 to 15. He is the youngest amongst us and yet he has a depth of experience and expertise, much of that experience that none of us here would ever have wished on someone so young. He uses his experience of the State care system to advocate for transformative change so that rangatahi will not have to experience what he did. Tēnā koe Tupua.

We have Denise Messiter. Denise is Ngāti Pukenga Ki Waiau, wahine toa. She has a background in indigenous communities in a range of countries to implement, again, transformative social and economic solutions that seek to reclaim their independence, their self determination, their mana motuhake. Denise is the General Manager of Te Whāriki Manawāhine o Hauraki, supporting whānau who have lived experience of mahi tūkino, or domestic and sexual violence and abuse in care, to design their healing pathways using tāngata whenua approaches that focus on the restoration of mana. Denise has a background in counselling with a focus on sexual violence. Tēnā koe Denise.

Our last panelist, Hera Clarke, Te Aupouri, Ngāpuhi, Ngāti Porou, has an extensive, incredible background as social worker and counsellor. She has senior – she has

experience in senior management, the Ministry of Social Development, Oranga Tamariki and its predecessor Child, Youth and Family. Hera has led family and sexual violence programmes and has been a social worker lecturer at Unitech teaching on Te Tiriti o Waitangi and whānau systems. She has also held senior roles in the Anglican Church.

So to start, this panel is very much determined what they're going to say and how they're going to say it. So we really have a spirit of manaakitanga that will push us through in these hours, we will be looking after each other. I will have a very, very light touch in that, but I just want to recognise it.

We're going to start with you, Paora, and for you really that question of whakapapa, of why we are where we are. Kia ora Paora.

MS MOYLE: Kia ora Tracey, thanks for the intro. I just want to be really brief in bringing us to where we are today. Without survivors and their journey there would be no Royal Commission of Inquiry. I want to mihi to every single survivor that's ever journeyed State care custody, every faith-based journey, every adoptee who has been taken from their whakapapa, all of us who have endured those journeys are a part of bringing about the Royal Commission of Inquiry.

I want to mihi to all of those who have been a part of lobbying Government for very many years; you know who you are, I don't need to name those people because there are so many. Some have been doing it their whole lives and I'm talking about Māori, non--Māori leadership, that have been vocal and many have put their whole lives towards lobbying Government for a Royal Commission of Inquiry, such is their journey, such is their conviction, their dedication to wanting change to occur; which culminated into July, I think it was, 6 July 2017 when hundreds of survivors, State care survivors ngā mōrehu gathered on the steps of parliament with 16,000 signatures gathered to give to MPs that were there on the day calling for the Royal Commission of Inquiry. February 2018 the Royal Commission began its work.

So I just wanted to briefly intro and mihi to all of those ones that have made it possible, kia ora.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Paora. You know, as I said, we've been doing some really deep listening over these last two weeks. Now the panelists are really going to reflect on the elements, the dimension, the things that have really stood out for them over these last two weeks, and to start this korero I go to you Matua Gary.

MR WILLIAMS: Tēnā koutou katoa. Ko Marotiri te maunga, ko Mangahauini te awa, ko Ngāti Porou te iwi.

[English: greetings everyone, Marotini is the mountain, Ngāti Porou is the tribe.] I'd like to start by acknowledging Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei for the – although we haven't been present in your whare we have been here for two weeks, so thank you for hosting us in this unique manner.

You can tell that I've got a speech impediment, so I'll talk slowly so other people can understand my words because my words are just as important as anybody else's. I'm going to start by reflecting on what I think I've heard over the last two weeks. What I've heard is that our society hasn't recognised that adults come with children, and so if we don't treat our children with love and respect and care, the adults get challenges. So what that is, I think I've heard that our children were treated like criminals, blamed for things they didn't do because they were children. I heard that the State tried to turn us Māori into Pākehā so that the State could feel better about itself. I heard that the State was wilful in this action to not learn and not adapt. I also heard that the system did not recognise human strength instead it packaged people as (inaudible).

I'm just going to say for disabled Māori, we're always near the bottom of the power in the hierarchy, because you're either not disabled enough or you're too disabled or you're not Māori enough, and if you are Māori enough then people want you to be Pākehā. So that's what I think I heard, but I'm going to pass back to you, Heather.

MS CLARKE: Tēnā koe e te tuakana. Tēnā hoki koe e Gary. Heoi anō, e tautoko marika ana ngā mihi kua mihitia e koe, Tracey. E tika hoki te mihi ki ngā haukāinga o te whare, Tumutumuwhenua. Te iwi o Ngāti Whātua. Ki a koe hoki te tuakana, e Taiaha. Tēnā koe mō wāu nei mihi ki a mātou ngā rekereketanga e atawhai mai ana i tēnei kaupapa.

[English: thank you the elder statesman, Gary, I am I really support your acknowledgments, Tracey. It is only right to acknowledge the locals and also the ancestral house

Tumutumuwhenua, also the Ngāti Whātua people and to you the elder statesman Taiaha,

thank you for your words of acknowledgment to us, the supporters who are tending to this matter.]

Kua mau ki a mātou, i runga i ō mātou pokowhiwhi ō kōrero atawhai, kia tau ai te rangimārie. Nō reira e tika ana. E tika ana te whakahoki te mihi ki a koe. Tēnā koe, tēnā hoki koutou. E harikoa ana kua tau. Heoi anō, ki ngā tini mōrehu, ki a koutou nei e pīkau tonu i tēnei mamaetanga. I ngā taimaha kua rongo ai mātou i te katoa o ngā wiki e rua kua pahure. Horekau he kōrero atu i te aroha, atu i te ngau, i te ngau o tēnei mea te taimaha.

Engari, he korero noaiho enei. Ko te tumanako kia tirohia, kia rapuhia hoki tetahi huarahi,

hei painga mō tātou, hei painga mō koutou katoa. Nō reira, tēnā rā koutou., tēnā koutou katoa.

[English: We have attained on our shoulders bearing your words of advice for everything to be settled in peace. Thank you, thank you to the people, I am very happy that the matter has been settled there. And also to the many survivors carrying the burdens and the weight, everything you have presented in these weeks, there is no other word apart from those expressed in love and also heartfelt feeling the gnaw of pain which you have expressed, but also for you to look for a path to rectifying all that has been – all the pressure that was on your shoulders.]

Ko wai tēnei? Āe, tika ake ngā kōrero o Tracey. Tipu ake i roto i te Nōta, i roto hoki i ngā nekeneketanga o ngā tīpuna, ko Ngāti Porou tērā. Ko wai ahau ki te whakahē i te whakapapa. Nō reira, tēnā koutou, tēnā hoki tātou katoa.

[English: Yes, it is correct what Tracey mentioned, I grew up in the north at the feet of my ancestors of Ngāti Porou also, so I cannot disregard that side of mine as well.]

I want to also acknowledge Pūao-Te-Ata-Tū, I want to honour those kaumātua and those kuia, Nā rātou te huarahi i parahia. Nā rātou parahia, mā wai? Mō wai atu? He aha kē te kaupapa. Ko ngā mokopuna te take, nō reira, rātou mā kua huri tū atu i te ārai. A koutou tērā, Te Rangihau. Nā koutou tēnei huarahi i tīmata ai mai ngā tau 1987.

[English: they forged the path and led the way, for who? For the grandchildren, for the descendants, they were the reason why. Therefore, I acknowledge those who have passed on John Rangihau, it was you all who began this process years ago from 1987.]

So I want to introduce that as part of my foundation as I listened, as I listened throughout the two weeks of the generosity being shared with us by the many survivors, by the many mōrehu across the country. I use my introduction to Pūao-Te-Ata-Tū because I remember travelling and being one of those nohinohi, kaimahi o te tari. My memory goes back to Te Rangihau, mō ōna mahi, Ani Tea and I've heard many of the other names being mentioned throughout this time.

I want to also celebrate, I want to celebrate the courage, the inspiration and the transformative actions that are taking place here and now. Ours is to affirm, to affirm that this hikoi is for us all. My pūtake, one of the first things that comes to mind as I look and reflect on the two weeks, and this came up very strongly, te rā i tango ai ngā tamariki i ō rātou kāinga noho [English: the day that the children were taken from their homes.] I was absolutely taken by the memories of many of our mōrehu who remembered the exact time

and the date when they were uplifted and the word is uplifted. I'm using tango (taken) here, because they were snatched from their homes.

Pūtake, so the impact that this has had on many of those who shared their stories, many of you heard throughout the week. I want to say that in my own summary, it's about the direct and intentional systemic and racial abuse on tamariki and whānau. Unsubstantiated evidence, you know, that really got to the ngako of why these mokopuna, there was no rhyme or reason that had anything to do with their living circumstances. Nobody was taking notice, no one was listening, aroha pūmau ana mō ēnei tamariki [English: genuine love towards these children.]

My second stand out. Ko tēnei mea te mokemoke me te mamae o ngā tamariki mō ō rātou mātua, me te wehenga o rātou [English: The hurt, the loss and the pain of these children in losing their parents] for our tamariki who were in care that were separated as siblings. Once again, systemic and racial abuse, little to nil consideration of what was and still remains the best interests of our tamariki. No whānau support was offered, nor accountability. Ngau pūmau ana te ngākau mō ēnei āhuatanga e tātou mā, ki a koutou ngā pakeke i tino kaha ai koutou te tū ki te kōrero kia whakakāhoretia ēnei mahi, e mihi rangatira ana ki a koutou katoa, ka heke, ka huri au ki a koe Denise, nō reira tēnā tātou.

[English: The pain gnaws at my heart, for you the elders who stood strong to express the desire to negate all the impacts and I also turn to you Denise, thank you all].

MS MESSITER: Tuatahi, tautoko ana ngā mihi kua mihi i te rā nei. Ka huri au te mihi ki a koutou Ngāti Whātua, e whakaruru mai ana ā tātou wairua me te mauri, mete kaha o ō tātou mōrehu. Mō ō koutou kōrero i whārikitia i waenganui i a tātou, e rua ngā wiki. Tēnei te mihi ki a koutou. Ka huri ake ki te mihi koutou, a mātou paparoa tautoko. E noho ana mai nei, tēnei te mihi ki a koutou. Ko te wahine nei nō Ngāti Pūkenga ki Waiau Ko Manaia te haukāinga.

[English: firstly I support the words of salutations to Ngāti Whātua who have tended to us and also to the survivors for your words that were furnished in these two weeks and also to the panel and in this room, greetings, welcome. I am from Ngāti Pukenga ki Waiau, Manaia is the ancestral land.]

I'm just going to, I suppose, cut to the chase in terms of what I've heard and I think what's stuck with me. So just – and I'm not sure if I'm going to say this in any systemic order and I'm acknowledging that, you know, we are talking about systemic and structural torture.

I want to start with this, and it's borrowed from Ani Mikaere and it's about the Crown as the consummate recidivist, and it's recidivism has been justified by the xenophobic foundation upon which racism and dehumanisation has taken place and has built a Care and Protection system that has tortured tamariki Māori and, dare I say it, continues to do so.

I've heard about the torture of tamariki in concentration type camps, I've heard about them being placed in detention, I've heard about the wholesale uplift of whānau Māori, tamariki Māori and being dumped and placed in places with people they don't know, with no connection to their whānau, no connection to their whakapapa, no connection to their whenua, no connection to their tūpuna. I've heard about rejection, I've heard about racism, I've heard about disconnection, I've heard about how our own turned on our own tamariki, Whakapakari and other places.

We've heard about the intergenerational transmission of pain, of hurt, of grief, and the unspeakable depth of spiritual harm. I've heard about broken spirits, I've heard about anxiety, confusion, depression, fear of crowds, fear of strangers. I've heard about the pipeline from care to prisons. I've also heard about this and it made me go right back to some early counselling days, and what came through for me was this whole diagnosis that was made up in America about Drapetomania. What is that? The desire to be set free from slavery. So what did our tamariki do? They ran. And then they were picked up again and punished for their desire to be free for their desire to be reconnected and returned to their whānau.

What I also heard, and it was said previously about the generosity and grace in which our tamariki in their adult bodies told their stories, told their truth, resounding truth, and their journeys to heal themselves, in whichever spaces and places that has taken place.

So I want to end with just a couple of things that I didn't hear. I didn't hear – and maybe this is coming in the next few weeks or next couple of months, I don't know; but I haven't heard anything about the abuse of our tamariki in special schools. And I didn't hear any honouring of the Tiriti, any care and protection for whānau, hapū and iwi Treaty partners in the care and protection of their children.

So I want to end where I started, and that is to sum it all up, the Crown is a consummate recidivist and abuser and it continues to give itself permission to do so through changes in naming itself, through changes in legislation that have everything to do with its own power and misuse of power and authority. That's what I heard. Tupua, ka hoatu te rākau ki a koe Tupua. (English: I'll pass on now to you Tupua).

MR URLICH: First of all I'd like to give a mihi to Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei. These are trying times for us all, and really appreciate the efforts that you've all put in to make this possible, so much aroha to you all and appreciate it.

You know, what stood out to me as I've been listening and watching these hearings is the pain, you know, the amount of damage and abuse and pain that the Crown has inflicted on people, on our people, the real life consequences of that on our people and on the spread throughout the generations.

What I find really hard to live with is the fact that they continue to evade responsibility and consequence for doing this. Who do we have to go to? You know, we can go to the Prime Minister, that's it, it's the Crown. It all stops with the Crown, the power is held there. They continue to drive forward this industry of oppression for our people and that starts with our babies, and it continues throughout our lives.

You know, as a father myself, I find it sickening that we can sit here and listen to a Government preach about raising the, you know, the qualities and things for our children, yet they're the ones that are falling behind more than anybody else. If the Crown was a person, one person, it would be the least trusted, most hated, last person you would want anywhere near a child.

MS MESSITER: Kia ora.

MR URLICH: When I listen to our whānau speaking, it really is like looking in a mirror. It truly is. The pain that I feel is so deep, and we know the cause of that. And that's why I find it even difficult, I'm just going to be honest, in this setting, a Royal Commission of Inquiry; the title alone is offensive to me, because what's royal, the Crown. The Crown has abused us, and we're here to plea our case, you know. It's just – it's a big evil beast that's profiting off the back of our people's trauma. It's generating our poverty and it's cashing in on the pain and it's still happening today. So while we are talking about what's happened, it's so important to remember it is still happening, that's why we are here.

Much like other whānau on this panel have been saying, you know, Matua Gary, tautoko, our society doesn't respect that adults come from children. I find that when we listen to our whānau a lot of that stuff that's happened in childhood has been ignored for so long, has been denied for so long, care and protection is not what we have. I'm just going to leave it at that.

You know, actually one last point around changing the names on things. People love redesigning what it looks like, but they fail to change what it feels like and how it

actually operates. We just continue to rebrand an abusive, oppressive system with a flashier name and pour more dollars into something that is harming our people.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora anō tātou. I mean I just wanted to catch, before you move on to the next one, really just wanting to catch some of those elements of what we have heard there. Gary spoke of the Crown and its agents being wilful in their actions, protecting those who did not need to be protected, and indeed should not have been protected, but did not protect those tamariki. There were so many duties and responsibilities and accountabilities that were not taken up; including our collective moral duty to protect our tamariki.

Hera also, in referencing Pūao-Te-Ata-Tū chaired by John Rangihau, about opportunities that were not taken up; she recognised that trauma, still so raw and real, even for those who first experienced that brutal uplift decades ago, speaks to something that Tupua has just acknowledged there around the non-recognition of what a system feels like. This is not a tamariki centred system, it's not a people centred system, it's system centred system.

Denise spoke of torture in the same way that I very mindfully talked about enslavement; she has mindfully spoken of torture. The unspeakable depths of spiritual harm, the soul wounds to individuals and to the collective, the way that the ability to trust the world is completely compromised.

The tamariki that we have heard speaking as adults speak to so many series of loss; but it is around that loss of hope, the loss of trust, the inability to trust the world and to navigate that world.

- **MS MESSITER:** Can you hear me Tracey?
- **PROF McINTOSH:** Yes.

- **MS MOYLE:** It's Paora here, I'm going to have a say.
- **PROF McINTOSH:** Kia ora Paora.
 - MS MOYLE: So what did I hear? What I heard was my baby brothers and sisters crying every time I heard a story. There's reflections there that take you back as a survivor and you are in that lived moment back when you were a kid. And you can almost, as a survivor, know what is going to be said next because our stories are so alike. So every child, every survivor who's had an experience that they've put over to the Royal Commission, there are similarities all the way through. Children do not lie.

What I heard also was a deafening silence. So it's almost not like what I heard, but what I didn't hear. And what I didn't hear was from any of our MPs, or leaders, or any of these organisations enough over those two weeks, that acknowledged the testimonies, the

Royal Commission itself, the testimonies that are being given over. There's just a deafening silence within Government.

And what that makes me feel like is that we don't exist, that you don't care enough, you don't give a damn. It's not good enough. What I heard was dehumanising. Human rights violations, intentional ethnic cleansing, cultural genocide and successive Governments covering this up, covering their own arses, not owning it, not doing enough. And we have this machinery that just continues to ride the backs of our whānau day after day. It keeps coming back, you know, Oranga Tamariki, changing its name from Child, Youth and Family, used to be Department of Social Welfare, before that it was Education Welfare. It's doing the same as it's always done.

We want it to stop. We want this genocidal practice that calls itself friggin social work to stop. You're not doing anything but creating your own industry, your own ticket clipping, your pay packets coming in on the backs of our tamariki. New Zealand Aotearoa needs to be ashamed of its human rights abuses. Take some responsibility, own up, get truthful, listen to all of our whānau, our survivorship that has been giving over their stories from time immemorial through to now because it hasn't stopped.

This bullshit rhetoric around 1950 to 1999, the whole reason you're putting that timeline on it is we've still got offenders, perpetrators working in ministries who were responsible for Whakapakari and some of the places, friggin horrible places that we've been hearing about all of this week. Some of those places my own siblings were in.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Paora, I might go to you Gary. Paora has really brought us to thinking about not just the hurt that stood out but what you think about it, how you feel about it.

MR WILLIAMS: I want to go back to the start of the testimony, because to get up and stand in the spotlight, to get people to listen and give a damn. I think that we need to stop the pipeline, we often talk about the ambulance at the bottom of the cliff. We need to stop people being shoved over the cliff and not only that we need to change, be intentional about change.

I also reflect on the Pākehā concept that New Zealand Aotearoa is called a paradise. It isn't for lots of people. It's a place of torture. It's a place of Māori like us getting disconnected from our identities and spending the rest of our lives trying to be people, trying to be people that we're not meant to be. It makes you have continual frustration about where I can't believe this is a sophisticated western democracy. We're still behaving like it's 1839.

We can be a catalyst for tangible change. It goes back to Pūao-Te-Ata-Tū. For 35
years we are still talking about what could be. We've got the resources in front of us, we
just need to get on and do it. Tracey, back to you.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora. I might go to you Denise.

1 2

- **MS MESSITER:** Is this about what we think about what we heard Tracey?
- **PROF McINTOSH:** Yeah, what we think about what we heard, what we feel about what we heard.

MS MESSITER: Okay. I thought a lot of things actually, typical. But one of the things that I thought was that, you know, we heard about hapū tamariki (pregnant children) and nothing being done about that, and it made me think about what happened to UNCROC? What happened to their human rights, what happened to the Treaty?

Then I thought to myself, the Crown has never been a good parent, carer or protector. And if it applied to itself its own reasonings for uplifting and taking our tamariki Māori and then giving themselves permission to torture them, they would charge themselves, put themselves in prison and throw away the key. I thought about the organised nature and culture of the violent dehumanisation of tamariki Māori and their whānau. I thought about, and I think about, the way in which they've bastardised our reo, and the imposters that they are and the imposters that they employ to deliver kaupapa Māori services to tangata whenua.

I've thought about how our tamariki have to continually prove – and we've heard the stories all through these two weeks – to prove, to ask to be heard, again and again and again. And, you know, typical, the whole culture of violence that exists in this country, is that the abuser gets away with it. How is the Crown going to do that? It wants to come up with a redress process for its own recidivism, for its own criminal actions, doesn't make sense.

You know, so it is time for – and some people will not like these words, but I'm going say it; it's how we do it becomes more important, it is time for utu and it is time for muru and it's time for Māori by Māori with Māori, care and protection services. So that's what I thought, and what did I feel?

For the last two weeks I've felt, I don't know if the word is desolate, but this desolate aroha for our tupuna, for the separation that they have been feeling, being separated from their mokopuna. Their loneliness, their longing for reconnection back to their mokopuna and for their mokopuna to be reconnected back to them. And the unspeakable resounding grief. And also felt compassion and sorrow – cried lots, used up

lots of tissues – for our whānau and our tamariki harmed, for the broken spirits and for those who have died as a result of being in the care and protection of the Crown. And for our people who have – and we heard them talk about this – been part of the pipeline from care to prison and some are never going to get out of prison.

So yeah, feeling – I did think I was going to feel angry, but I think I felt enraged at certain points in time about, as you said at the beginning, Tracey, the profound honesty and truth and the graciousness and the generosity with which our people shared their truth and their story and their solutions. So that's my thinking and my feelings. Kia ora.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Denise. I might move to you Hera.

1 2

MS CLARKE: Tēnā anō tātou. Ko tētahi o ngā kōrero e puta mai ana i roto i ngā kōrero e kōrerohia nei i ōku hoa i te taumata nei nā, e pēnei ana.

[English: one of the statements that came out by my friends on the panel was this:) time for muru, time for action, time machines.]

E rongo mātou i ngā kōrero i puta mai e pā ana ki tēnei mea te time machine. Ka pēhea ai tātou e whakahoki ki taua tīmatanga i kōrero, e kōrero nei, e tētahi o ngā whanau kua kōrerotia. Ngā mōrehu. Te tamāhine o tētahi o ngā mōrehu.

[English: We heard the testimonies about the time machine. How can we go back to the root that they speak of, that one of the family's survivor spoke of, the daughter of one of the survivors.]

So what does that look being in a time machine and how do we take stock, really, of enacting. Because that's really the space of muru, kia murua ai ngā hara [English: for those sins to be rectified.] I too, like Denise, went through this whole cycle, just being present. You know, we're advocates for this mahi, and we've listened for many and many years, of many whānau who have come and we've worked alongside and continue to work alongside today.

But never, and I will say, never have I heard so many stories in such a short space of time. I have to say that I was pained at different times, that a response couldn't go to the depth to lift, kia hikia i te wairua o ngā whānau e kōrerohia nei. E hara tēnei he whakahē ki a koutou o te iwi, te whare Tumutumuwhenua. Ehara tēnei he hē. Ko aku nei whakaaro, i kite mātou te katoa o ngā kuia, ngā pakeke e kōrerotia ana ō rātou nei mamae, kia puta mai. Ka aroha marika, mō te wairua e noho konā ana, nē. Aini pea i muri mai ō rātou kōrero ka haere rātou ki te horoi, ki te karakia, ki te aha raini. Engari, ko ngā kōrero whakatika ki a au nei, ko ngā mahi o ngā kaumātua. Mā rātou e hoputia te wairua, kia whakahokia i roto i te wā kua tukuna atu.

[English: to lift the spirits of the families that has been spoken of. This is not to deny the tika of Tumutumuwhenua whare is, but it's a great thing to see the elders speaking, releasing their pain within them. Much heartfelt love for the spirit in which it has been said. Perhaps after their statements they go to wash, say a prayer. However, the rectifying statements will be by the doings of the elders to grasp the spirit and then return to those that have been affected.]

So I became quite sad at different times, and figuring out whether that sadness came from a place of anger at the torture, anger at the enslavement against (very vulnerable children). So I want to just – what I had here was around he mana anō tōku ingoa [English: my name has meaning,] very profound throughout the whole two weeks listening to mōrehu speak about their names and how significant, how that becomes the only thing that they can hold on to.

So the messaging, the kōrero puta mai, e tika ana ngā tuahine nei [English: yes, my colleagues are correct], the messaging in the wahi tare kōrero nui atu i a rātou. So there's a huge learning inside of that for us to never forget kia tika ai te mau o te ingoa, he mana anō kē te ingoa [English: to pronounce names properly. Names have power.] So I wrote here that Māori principles, rights, values and beliefs were disregarded by State representatives, fumbling or mispronouncing Māori names were unnoticed to everyone in authority except the owner of the name. Whakatikangia, koina te tū i te mahi, tū ki te whakatika [English: Please correct this, correct this.] One of our very dear kuia once told me, mēnā ka kite koe i te hē whakatikangia, nō rēira koina ōku kōrero mō tēnei wā e Tracey [English: if you see something wrong, correct it. And therefore that is my statement for this session, Tracey.] Kia ora e Paora.

- **PROF McINTOSH:** Paora, would you like to say something more or I'll go to Tupua?
- **MS MOYLE:** No you're going to stay with me, thanks Tracey.
- **PROF McINTOSH:** Kia ora.

MS MOYLE: Look as a survivor I just want to acknowledge, you're asking me how I think and how I feel. When you are listening to the survivor stories anxiety sets in, triggers set in.

And I'm sitting here worried about how I think and how I feel and I'm aware that I don't think and I don't feel. And I'm worried that my colleagues have talked so on-the-money about voicing back what it is that they heard. And I care about what I want to say, and there's just so much, I feel saturated and drowned in it, but also really consciously aware and it circulates, what do I say and do.

1 2

3

4 5

6

7

8 9

10 11

12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24 25

26 27

28 29

30 31

32

33 34

But I also have to acknowledge that it is what it is in the moment, and it makes me know that every survivor who has to tell their story, this is how they feel and sometimes you don't know until two days later what it is that you've said and how you've come across, and you just have to trust in the moment that your tīpuna are sitting with you and they help guide you to say what it is that they and you need to say and I'm sitting here and I'm thinking about my mokopuna and my own survivor story. And without the want of talking about myself, I relate it to what I've heard, that how we have the courage to step out of intimate partner violence, family violence that resulted from feeling shit about yourself and not knowing any different pathway, but to try and find someone where you belong that they may not be any good for you. And how you survive that and come away from it, and you save your own child from having to go through that cycle and the fear of DSW coming to get your own babies because of your own background and connection.

And they know everything and they've got everything on you. And if you have a background in DSW you've grown up in there, that's another mark against you in their predictive risk modelling. You're assessed as being less, under par, that you're a risk to your own baby, and you have to fight that, so you force yourself to join DSW, or Child, Youth and Family, and have a career in there; because, one, when you're in the club they don't come after their own. And that's how you save your self and your child from being accosted or the spotlight being on you.

How do I feel? I feel like I'm drowning in shit day after day. I see the social work profession looking after itself and covering itself and it's still – the ANZASW and the Social Work Registration Board come out and say "yes, well we've heard this review and there's recommendations of that review, but you're still okay, we still want the social work profession to know that you do your best, you are good people, you're registered."

I don't give a rat's razu about that, because on the whole, the social work profession that I'm a part of, or have been a part of, continue to target, they target young Māori mothers, and they do so without any analysis, they're not trained enough, they're not competent enough to work with Māori to understand that when you target a young Māori mother in hospital having given birth and you all go in there and take that baby, what it does to that baby. The rest of the whānau, they're grieving for that loss as well as that disconnect from that child having to grow up with strangers. All of that plays a part to weaken whānau.

I'm tired of the attack on whānau, the weakening of them. I want local solutions, people who are best experts on themselves. It shouldn't be happening at a national level

because that's arrogance, that's white arrogance saviourism, and that's what social work is premised on; save the brown baby from these terrible brown people. And most of the decisions that social workers make, based on predictive risk modelling, is about having no regard, no respect, no trust in Māori to take care of their own.

And still this premise that everything has to be about the nuclear family. When you look at local people and rural areas, there's whakapapa there. Not every single Māori person is incapable of bringing up a child, there are whole whānau out there who are connected, that are healthy, that are living, that contribute to their communities, that can take care of their own. It's an arrogance, an absolute beyond understanding arrogance at ministerial level and across ministries that they all converge to have the same mistrust of Māori, riding on the backs of vulnerable people, disconnecting them.

It has to stop. I want it to stop. I want transformative change in my lifetime. I'm really pleased that I'm able to have mokopuna now that have grown up in love and kindness and safety. And I see them not having to worry about feeling shit about themselves because they have no idea what that means. That's the way our babies have to grow up, that's the way I want them to grow up with their own, knowing who they are.

Yeah, we do need protective services, but I believe that we can strengthen from localised level ground up and that we've got some – we've got amazing people out there who are already doing the mahi, away from Oranga Tamariki, avoiding Oranga Tamariki, and keeping our babies safe. You only have to look at what's already out there to know that it's been happening for a long time.

Yeah, that's what I'm thinking and feeling right now, I hope that that's okay. Kia ora.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Paora, ngā mihi. And Tupua. I'll go to you now.

MR URLICH: I just want to tautoko what Paora was just, you know, her korero just then, related to every aspect of what was said there, and agree 100%.

One thing I'm feeling is an unrelenting sense of urgency. We can't wait. Our people can't wait. We can't wait for the Government to pull their finger out and start doing the right thing, and it's a hard place for us to be in who have survived the system pushing for change.

Another thing as well as I was listening to our whānau and their kōrero, is there's a strong need to reconnect us to our whānau, for the State to stop viewing our tamariki as being separate to us, they belong to our whānau. Yet every decision that's made about them, they say they have family group conferences, you ask me how whānau-centric those

are. I'm telling you right now, it's just an environment where the State bring the whānau in to power trip on them.

So, you know, we talk about child wellbeing, yet we think that can be achieved by isolating them from the people they come from, from their home, from their whenua. Just so many, you know, questions, and I guess Paora, actually you answered quite a few of those around the lack of respect for our culture and, you know, and I'm – yeah, I'm no fool, I know it's all intentional.

But at the same time out of love for our whānau, I'm trying to think of ways that we can channel, you know, I can channel my own emotions in a way that's going to be beneficial to them, because it's toxic, you know, it's so toxic. And the abuse doesn't stop when you leave the system, we all know that. We're hearing that, we've heard that throughout the past two weeks, that it stays with us, that it affects us in different ways.

But I'll tell you what I'm feeling as well, is I'm feeling proud, I'm proud to be in this space with these people standing up and speaking out on things that make us feel bad, make us feel the need to isolate, or to not own parts of our lives, because it makes us different, it makes us feel less. And I know we're still doing this mid -kōrero, but I want to mihi to the panel members, for the mahi that you do. I know what it takes out of us to step into these spaces and that shows how big your aroha is for our people. And, you know, walking away is tempting because it's heavy, it's hard. But we know the cost of doing that, we know that we can't do that.

So yeah, I'll end on this. I'm feeling proud to be in this space with these brave people sharing equal love for our whānau and a sense of urgency to get this right by them for them. And lastly, I think the Crown could be more beneficial by stepping out of some spaces. You know, they want to know what they can do, what they can do, a lot of the time it's back off.

MS MESSITER: Yeah, back off.

1 2

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Tupua. Really powerful words for us to go, we'll have a break now and go to the morning tea. When we return, the panel will really talk about their calls to action. Kia ora tātou.

Adjournment from 11.16 am to 11.33 am

COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koutou katoa, welcome back to our panel discussion. I'm going to just cross back live to the panel Chair, Professor. Back to you, tēnā koe.

PROF McINTOSH: Tēnā koe. Kia ora ano tātou. In this final part of the session our panelists are really going to speak to what they see as the calls to action, calls to action for the

Commission, Government, service providers, whānau, hapū, iwi, and so I will immediately go to you, Denise.

MS MESSITER: Kia ora, I'll just start with the call to action for the Crown, State; and it is in the context of the Crown as the consummate recidivist. And it was said by Tupua prior to our break that the Crown really does need to take a back seat. What does that look like? Part of that looks like the Crown must charge, take to court, those who are still alive and who are known and there is evidence that they have abused tamariki in care. They must stop employing those people in their own departments, whether they're still in the Care and Protection Department or they've moved to the Police or the education system, wherever.

This is also in the context of apology, what a real apology might look like. No sense being sorry and continue to do the same thing over again, which is often what we see in the area of violence and the sector we work in. The abuser continues to say sorry and continues to abuse.

So part of a genuine apology is being able to see measurable and transformative change that is measured by whānau, hapū and iwi and their whānau who have been abused in care.

The criminal records of those who have gone from care through to the prison pipeline must be expunged. I heard a number of people talk about this over the last couple of weeks, is that for those of our whānau who are able to, who want to, who desire to, to have the Crown, its representatives – not a local site, the ministers, whomever – to rock up to their marae for our whānau who have been harmed in care to have their say kanohi ki te kanohi, to face them, to be able to say, for them to be able to give back the abuse, the pain, the hurt and the suffering. Put it back where it belongs.

This is all short term stuff, this is not going to take 5 or 10 years to figure it out. It's not like it can't be done tomorrow. If you can pick children up in day you can return them all in a day. So short term and short term means within the next year, if we can, tomorrow, yesterday maybe, but support; existing whānau, hapū and iwi and tangata whenua services, existing ones who use tangata whenua approaches to support whānau in terms of wraparound services, must be fully resourced to support their whānau heal.

Whānau must be fully resourced to take care of their own children, particularly those that the Crown thinks needs to be in care and local sites need to take the time and the effort to find whānau who are able to and who can care for their own.

Social workers – and I'll just say this – need to let whānau be the owners of their own whakapapa. What does that mean? It means the Crown must return to every tamariki

Māori who has been taken into care their whakapapa, all of their records must be returned to them. The Crown, through its social workers, must stop telling whānau Māori what their whakapapa is. The Crown doesn't own whakapapa, it belongs to whānau, it belongs to hapū, it belongs to iwi.

Something that Tupua said about the system doesn't feel, and it doesn't. To be able to care for children you must have a heart and a longing and desire for them, you must love them. An assessment process isn't about loving a child. An assessment process and profiling risk, and all of those sorts of things, are about re-designing and re-labelling tamariki Māori into something they are not.

Our children shouldn't be taken away because of homelessness when they didn't create it. The system, the Crown needs to address those things. Homelessness is often used as a reason to continue to take our children. We heard about poverty, some of the impoverished situations that some whānau lived in, but it wasn't about the poverty, it was about the connection to whānau that was important. So we need to stop seeing our children through materialistic eyes and measuring them by the number of shoes they have or don't have.

We often hear about, you know, a Tiriti based approach to Care and Protection and we have 7AA stuff. That's just more window dressing for the Crown. I'm not convinced that the Crown is in a position to develop Treaty based relationships or approaches to Care and Protection. I am convinced that the survivor stories we've heard, the survivors that we've heard from, that they are the ones that must lead the redesign of a Care and Protection system. That isn't necessarily about keeping the Crown in place, but about sharing and giving resources back to whānau, hapū and iwi to design and to care for their own, to design their own services and care for themselves.

Survivors must lead the restoration process. Survivors must design the restoration process and the abusers must accept what their designs are and how that is going to work.

Some more short term things. We heard about assessment processes, we heard about a lack of monitoring and reporting, we've heard about FGC, the FGC process. It's all part of the glue that keeps a torturous system in place.

Local sites need to be led by survivors and survivors need to be employed in those sites. Not so that they can take our children, but so they can help design the reasons that they don't need to be taken in care. That they can support whānau who may be struggling.

 $\label{eq:continuous} \mbox{I'm just going to leave it there for now. Otherwise I'll keep talking. So Tracey, you can -$

1 2

PROF McINTOSH: We'll come back to you, Denise. It's too important. If we could move — we'll pass it now to Hera.

MS CLARKE: Tēnā koutou, tēnā tātou ano. I wanted to start my response with, I think, quite a profound kōrero by one of our mōrehu we listened to this week. Ko te amorangi ki mua, ko te hapai ō ki muri [English: the leader in front and the bearer behind.] When I think about what that meant on the day, and I think about how we whakaherea taua whakaaro ki te manawa i tukuna atu te kōrero [English: how we tie in that thought to the heartfelt messages in the statements.] So when I put that and matched that against the kōrero from our mōrehu, an immediate response that comes to mind is this price of citizenship, and the cost, and the cost of citizenship to our tamariki, to tamariki whose stories we listen to, who spoke through the adults this week.

The cost has been filled with stolen childhoods and intergenerational brokenness. We listened to that, we hurt with all of the korero that we listened to this week. Stolen childhoods. And rolling uncertainties into something called adulthood. And it just really gave a real longing, a real longing as we start to talk about what call to action, these are what are prompting us to identify the call to action. This and many others.

My colleagues will continue to pick this up as we continue to speak. But it's a huge, you know, it's a big – it's a big expectation when you think about the price of citizenship that tamariki paid the price, because that's the stories we're listening to today. That's the motivation that pushes us forward to say whakatikatikangia ngā taumahatanga, ngā mamae e haere tonu mō ō mātou nei tamariki, me ngā tamariki e kōrerohia nei a Tupua inaianei [English: To correct the burdens, the hurt that continues for the children, the children that Tupua speaks of that happens right now.]

So consistently, really, to what Denise has talked about, that whole sense of being included and we listened to that the last two weeks. If it's about me, then include me. These are not new, these are not new korero, we've listened to them for many a years, like hello.

And they offered, the generosity that was given and shared with us this week has been in many forms by those who spoke "we're here, despite what's happened for us, there's this huge forgiveness", and I struggle with that. I struggle hugely with that. But it's there, it exists. Kia hāpaitia ngā tūmanako e tukuna atu nei e ngā mōrehu kei mau ia mātou i ēnei kōrero e kōrerohia nei kia anga whakamua [English: To lift them up, to lift their aspirations that have been expressed by the survivors, that they have expressed to look forward.]

we go forward, we've listened to these generosity pieces of, once again, morehu giving of

themselves to be present and to be in the moment, to be part of designing, to be part of

So when we are talking about acknowledging the past so that ki anga whakamua, so

1

2 3

6 7

8

9 10

11 12

13 14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25 26

28

27

29 30

31 32

33 34

codesigning. 4 5

And the important curtail that I listened from the morehu is that "I'm not me in isolation, I am part of my whole whānau. My siblings, my mum, my dad". We listened to the stories of how whānau couldn't understand what the hell were they doing in this place of uncertainty. Nobody talked to us, nobody asked us.

And now they're putting their hands up to say "we want to be part of going forward". Actually, so we're here to assert and say that they be there, horekau he korero atu i tēnā. [English: and no other statements apart from that] support services for their whānau. Education, many of them talked about "I could have been at university today if this ngangara hadn't been in my way. I could have been a lecturer. I'm helping out in the Government departments in the institutions today". But hello once he gets a little bit too clever, kua whakamutunga, the project stops and we listen to that. When it was enhancing the skill sets of morehu that were institutionalised, those programmes were cut. Kaput, finished. So educational grants to morehu and their whānau whānui. Those mokopuna deserve it.

Justice and judiciary, criminal offences, and as Denise has spoken, whakatikangia, whakatikangia (correct it, rectify it). We heard how many of our morehu whanau took the fall for somebody else, more often Crown. MSD historic claims, e hoa, kei hea te huarahi mō ō mātou nei whānau. He aha te take? (English: oh dear, where is the pathway for the families? What is the purpose?). Sometimes I get a little bit rangirua i roto o korero (confused).

So MSD claim systems and processes, they need to be looked at through the eyes of the mōrehu. Ko rātou e pīkau nei i tēnei ngāngara e kai ana i a rātou.

Whakarongo! [English: They are carrying these evil burdens that are eating them from within, listen.]

Oranga Tamariki to involve morehu in as many aspects of service as possible, but I'm going to name some; in caregiver and practise operations and its ministry advisory boards, whakarongo ki te reo, ki te ngākau o ngā morehu [English: listen to the voices and to the hearts of the survivors.] The formal apologies we've listened to as well, local, regional, and some people talked about national bodies as appropriate. But let's not run in with the big guns, because we know like the kauta, the work really on the whare happens

inside the kauta, whāngai atu, whāngai atu [English: the dining house. Feed them, feed everybody.]

Financial compensation, calling to action is according to the experiences of the morehu claimants and their whānau, not a one glove fits all. Provisions for morehu who seek to support and encourage other morehu, to share their experiences on their journey to healing. So we heard a vast offering from many morehu who put their hands up, put their hands up to help others. We see and we know that a number of our morehu Māori in particular, are not coming forward. So here's a generous offer by morehu to be proactive, ruru mai ana te rākau (English: to shake the tree), shaking the trees that encourages other morehu to come forward. Koina ano oku korero mo tēnei wahanga, tukuna atu ki a koe Gary (English: That is my statement for now. I will now pass on to Gary).

MR WILLIAMS: Thanks Hera. I've got quite a long list to work through. I'm going to start with survivors. Whatever happened it has to be about us. We have to start now because people are dying, because of the way they're being forced to live their lives. So we need to get on with it. And now thinking about the Commission. I know you're just a messenger, but I'd like your messages to be bold. I want them to have new and old messages, because the old messages haven't been understood, or nobody cares. I want the new messages to be about the here and now. I want your recommendations to be explicit, so they can't be distorted by the decision makers. I want the Commission to signal that there will be a hub at the end of the tunnel. I feel like we've been in this whirlpool for years and years, and we need to get out and get on with it.

I wonder if the recommendations cannot be generic because it goes into a nothingness that goes nowhere. I want the Government to be prepared to give up some of its power and control. We've had many years of doing it your way. It hasn't worked for us, so be a bit brave and get out of the way and let's get on with it. Because you're living in a false universe if you believe you can keep doing it your way and it will be good. How long will it take for you to learn that you're not the solution, you're the problem. Actually you are the problem.

For disabled Māori, we have to prove that we've got to be perfect parents, otherwise the State takes our kids. We've had this long discussion about whakapapa, so people need to reconnect back to their whakapapa, because that's where they come from. We weren't born Pākehā, we were born Māori. I know lots of us have some Pākehā blood in us, but we are inherently Māori and that's where we want to place ourselves.

I think that the other thing the Government could use, less policies and legislation which harm people. The last I heard last week was the Adoption Act. When the biological parents give permission for their records to be unsealed for their children, the State still stops that. I think if we're going to look at practice for success, we need to reduce the number of people in care so that it gets down to zero. Having people in care is a foreign concept that we must leave so we have to look at different models.

I also want to say I don't want this work to become a political football because I don't want people who haven't got a personal vested interest in the outcomes to determine what the outcomes ought to be.

I want to finish by saying this: Whānau, hapū and iwi, we want to come home to who we belong to. For a long time we've been ostracised, because of the lies. So I want to go back to Ngāti Porou because my circumstances are different than 50 years ago. I know that I would be on the pae today but I'm not, I'm here, so those are my initial thoughts for Māori for this Inquiry.

I'll pass it on to Denise or...

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora matua. Your words reach us with such depth, ngā mihi. I'll move to you now, Paora.

MS MOYLE: Kia ora. I want to acknowledge what Gary has said, what Denise and Hera have said, all of our panel have been talking about. I'm not going to repeat the things that we've heard so powerfully put across in terms of pathways forward; what redress might look like, what true transformative change might look like.

I wanted to talk about the plant, the shoot unfurling and unfurling to become its full potential. In that picturesque example of survivorship, potential unfurling to become something blossomed and grown and achieved. It's okay if the sapling that has been trampled on doesn't get to be any further than bent over or growing invertedly into the ground, or some other way other than the achieved or the societal expectation of you having bloomed to your full. Because I personally believe that survivors are here to teach, to be living, breathing examples that mirror the need for society to be aware of its, or become aware of its, own humanity.

I'm thinking about the Royal Commission of Inquiry and all of those who participated in bringing it about. I think about this Māori hearing that is historical, herstorical, will never come again and those that have been chosen to be the Commissioners, and to me it's a very expensive exercise that we look to to have so much

potential to bring about transformative change, and to put on the table everything that we're putting forward passionately from lived experience, from everything.

And I think about Māori being the most impacted grouping of people that have come to the Royal Commission's fore, yet we haven't been able to do it kanohi ki te kanohi, and how many survivors would have loved to have been. Whatever reason we've been spun, personally I feel put over there again, you know, that I couldn't be a part of being at Ōrākei with all the other survivors. I know we live in the times of Covid and all of that, but I still think that there was more that could have been done, because we're tired of being put over there. We want to be heard, we want to be in the same space.

I just needed to say that, because I'm not the only one that thinks and feels, because when you look at the Royal Commission, and it's already entering into negotiations with some of the faith-based organisation, the Catholics, the Anglicans, I don't know about the Presbyterians and some of the other faith-based, but I know that the cogs are already turning, but I don't see any survivors at the table enough.

And when we've tried to be employed inside the machinery, very often we've been invited to be a part of being at the table. And, you know, no disrespect to the survivor advisory groups and the Taumata, but when we've been invited and you try, you're a risk because of your background, or you're a risk because you have worked in an organisation that might be investigated. That is part of side lining and disrespecting survivors, and what they bring to the richness of making transformative change happen. So I'm not going to hold my middle digit up, but that's how I feel.

I'm just going to have a myriad of different thoughts that I've had whilst my colleagues have been speaking, and it's in no particular order. I want imposter services to stop doing their do and pretending to be kaupapa Māori in our community. Whatever you work for, health, education, social services, stop calling yourselves kaupapa Māori, we're able to bestow your mana back upon you, we're able to – there are no processes in place. You know, so that you can have our funding, Māori funding, and again that's riding on the backs of our people. Be who you are.

I want to say don't sign up to social work to be a social worker if you haven't checked your own privilege, if you haven't checked your own bias, your own pain, what you bring to the table. Because if you're a person that hasn't worked on your own shit, I believe that it's going to bleed out on to our own, and we don't need to, we don't need that. You know, if we're being touted as, or we have to pass the fit and proper test, I think we have to come back to ourselves and see ourselves as being fit and proper before we go into

working with vulnerable communities, and bestowing something that doesn't belong to you to bestow, because you haven't got what that takes. It's another lie. And I see it so much in social work, and I've already mentioned what I think about that, there's just – I just think burn it all to the ground and let's start again.

Again my colleagues have said healing pathways don't have to be – they have to be survivor led and I really want the Royal Commission to not just put the weighting in getting faith-based and State alongside and looking at compensation, what that's going to look like, who's going to be responsible for what; I want healing pathways to also include the ways in which our people want to begin the healing, because you'll never get back your life, you'll never get back your childhood. You can, in your own living experience, go from what you were, the shoot to your own unfurling plant in whatever way you deem yourself to be okay, you know, we talk about I could have gone to university, or I could have done this. You've survived. You've survived and you're here, and it's your story that's bringing us to look at the way in which we need to do things differently. I think that's pretty powerful, that's pretty contributory.

You already are great, your potential already is amazing. Why? Because you come from all of those, you are the blueprint of all of those that you come from and your mokopuna to come. I'm not the perfect person, I know I talk a lot out on this kaupapa, you know, you get into trouble for it sometimes by being a waha nui, (a big mouth) but you've just got keep on going and doing the best that you can and being okay in how you contribute to bring about change. Because that's what we're all doing, we are all not divided but we are together. We have to be together.

I remember Paora talking about 31 years of good and then – 31 years of, you know, trouble in his life then 31 years of trying to put it right in the eyes of everybody else who kept on dowsing him with limits and you will never be the full sapling, because you can't be. When is enough enough? You know. When somebody changes their life enough to begin working with women and children and men and local people and getting it right, and still being dogged that you're not enough. It has to change.

I am going to mention this, because we've talked about it and the other person that sticks out for me is when you talk about having met Coral in the year 2000 and 22 years later Coral's talking about having met you in 2000. And our question, my question is, and what have you done for him? If he's told you a story in the year 2000, 22 years later, what's changed? What have you done for him? You know, that's a stark question that's sat with me.

1 2

 And I think that it's an example of how we can tout that we are connected to something, or I have this with you back then. What are you doing to make change occur? What are you as social workers and organisations, how are you really supporting true transformative change to happen? We have to all be in this together, you have to want to see and listen to the voices of survivors, listen to the whakapapa disruption over aeons.

You have to check your own humanity. Yeah, we're all in this together. Kia ora.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Paora. Again, just want to recognise your leadership and recognition that you are more than enough. I'll pass to you now, Tupua.

MR URLICH: Kia ora. Just to tautoko kōrero around pathways Paora. You know, that's one of the powerful things about having that lived lens on this situation. Before we can lay down those pathways there are a lot of walls that need to be knocked down, and only the eyes of lived experience can identify those walls. Because – and I don't claim to be any expert on social work, I've never practised it in my life, but I've been in this space, and what I can tell you is that these people are hardwired to think a certain way, to see a certain way. That doesn't allow them to see where the actual problems are, because they're taught that this is the right way of doing things and yet it continues to fail to deliver, yet for some reason it's still the right way.

Another thing that I feel quite passionate about addressing is the fact that I don't believe it's right that Oranga Tamariki is the assessor and the service provider. It has so much power in that space, it's created a big industry, a lot of money involved and we're telling them you go and assess whether or not this child needs to come into your care. What do we think they're going to do, of course they are. They continue to do this stuff and it's nothing new.

Devolution, we hear a lot about it, I tautoko that 100%. But at the same time it has to be balanced. The Crown has created this issue, you don't just palm it off to our iwi. You know, that's not right, you don't create a massive problem and say "oh well, you take over." The way forward has to be designed with our lived experience, with our iwi, the Crown's role in this, other than, you know, resourcing, is nothing, it's simply that. You tautoko, you know, give us what we need to take care of our own and back off.

Even today, you know, as an advocate, in my mahi as national care experience lead for an independent advocacy organisation, even today we are not being listened to. We have ministers come out and call us grizzlers, yet they love telling the media "we've got advisory groups on this and that" and, they don't bloody listen to them. I'm sick of the

tokenistic representation that the Government feels so comfortable to turn to whenever they're asked a hard question and without them actually listening to us.

Something that was said earlier around whānau being the owners of their whakapapa. That really – that sits strongly with me. I look at my own tamariki, and you can see it, you know, but I could never see that in myself. And a lot of our whānau still can't see that, so the isolation the disempowerment is rife among our people, and it stems from these early days.

I remember years ago I attended an Iwi Leaders Forum. My pātai was what are you doing to keep us connected, to keep us educated, to reconnect us to who we are. Because at the moment it's been left up to the Crown and they're failing. And aroha mai to do this, but the question's still the same today. What are our iwi leaders doing for our young people in care to keep them connected? And yes, I acknowledge that the system does a bloody good job of making that difficult to do, but difficulty is not a reason for us to still not be doing it. That's where the detachment starts.

We go into an oppressive system that denies us of our identity, that makes us feel ashamed to be Māori, and we're supposed to grow and develop as Māori? It doesn't work that way, we become wards of the State, we become ashamed of who we are and our experiences.

So moving forward I come back to that, for the Crown to understand that we are the experts on this. You have had hundreds of years to prove that you clearly aren't up to it. And, Paora, I think you said that korero around having to prove you're fit for purpose, the irony eh, the people who failed to take care of tamariki telling us that we're not fit for purpose, eh?

MS MOYLE: Yeah.

1 2

MR URLICH: But as someone who has been through this and now taking part in this Royal Commission process, the challenge to the Commission is don't take mana away from what we've given you. Because talking about things is not easy, but what makes it harder is when you're talking the same things over and over again, and the situation remains the same for our whānau, for our babies.

I think it's – yeah, like I keep coming back to it, you know, throughout this – the hearings actually, it's brought up a lot of that trauma, and a lot of stuff that I hadn't revisited since some of it occurred. And I just wish that people could truly feel what we're feeling, even for a minute, and remember that while, you know, for those in our society that maybe aren't Māori or don't have to deal with the system, remember, these tamariki live next door

to you, they go to school with your tamariki, they're part of our community and they'll be the future of our country.

1 2

We all have a role and we should all be passionate about addressing these issues, not because they're Māori or because they're this or that, because they are babies, they are children. We love to brag about how great a country this is to live in and how much privilege there is here, but that's only for some. You know, don't get lost in your own privilege and start believing that it's the same for everybody; because there is real disparities in this country and it doesn't just, you know, the Care and Protection system are just one piece of that.

Every Government department fails to deliver for Māori. And why? Because we have Pākehā creating systems based on western world ideologies and beliefs and they're supposed to deliver for Māori? You know, we talk about the Treaty partnership and that, but we're a long way off realising that, a long way off. I feel for my tūpuna who signed the Te Tiriti o Waitangi and seeing what its people are now living with.

So what have I learned from a lot of my life in this space is that you can't take the Crown's word for nothing. And that the cost is – I don't even like that word the cost. But the consequence for us is this – continues. We can't, we can't sit back and just allow this stuff to continue. When we're in these spaces and our voices are there it's great, but we need to be listened to, there needs to be action. I haven't been doing this nearly as long as some of my fellow panel members, but it's draining, it's like carrying a tonne of bricks on your back walking into these spaces. It takes time to heal, every engagement with Crown agencies or different areas, you step into those spaces, and you see the ignorance, and the, you know, the patronising, the whole "great that you're here" and that; I don't need that. I need you to listen. And I need you to act.

In terms of just one final point around, you know, recommendations. Stop killing our people. That's what you are doing. That's what this pain and this trauma and all this does, you kill us. We may be alive but we're dead. A lot of us can't feel because it was never safe to feel. A lot of us don't experience things in this world that we should experience because of the pain and the trauma and the changes that were made in our minds and in our spirits as babies.

You are depriving people of life. I'm serious about this. Yes, it's trauma and abuse, but most of us just suffer our way through until the end, and for those who have the courage to stand up and get it, yes, help is there. The hardest part is actually being in a position where you're ready to take that step. Yeah, and I'll end there.

1	PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Tupua. Thank you for your korero. I'm just going to ask now if we
2	want to have a break for 5 minutes before we just come back for some words? I think we
3	do, so if we could just have a break for 5 minutes and we'll come back. Kia ora tātou.
4	Adjournment from 12.25 pm to 12.35 pm
5	COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koutou katoa, welcome back everyone. I'll just cross back
6	live to our facilitator Professor McIntosh who's leading our discussion today with the panel
7	Kia ora Tracey.
8	PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora tātou. We're just now going to move through the panel, certainly
9	not the last words. All of these panel members have dedicated and committed, at
10	significant personal cost, but for the love of our people to speaking out. They totally
11	epitomise a ka whawhai tonu mātou (we will fight on). So they will not be last words but
12	before we hand back to the Commissioners, just going to allow all the panelists to have
13	some final words for today and we'll start in the same order, we'll start with you, Denise.
14	MS MESSITER: Kia ora. I saw a post the other day that sort of said something like never again,
15	this should never happen again. It sort of reminded me of Whina and her "not one more
16	acre of Māori land", but there have been since that, since her wording of that heaps of
17	whenua have been taken. And when I'm using whenua I'm using it in the context of
18	Papatūānuku but also thinking about whenua in terms of our wāhine; how many of them
19	have birthed their babies and their babies have been taken from them.
20	So I think within that context, and some of the things I heard around, and I'm still
21	left wondering around this whole, this deep hatred of our people. And I think about in the
22	context, you know, we talk about colonisation and colonial processes and all of those sorts
23	of things and how our wahine and tamariki have been disregarded through this whole
24	process. The sacredness of giving birth, the sacredness of being hapū, the sacredness of
25	whenua ki te whenua taken away.
26	So, you know, so there is that, and then we heard about hope and trust, you know,
27	we want to be left with hope, we want to trust that something is going to happen. As Tupua
28	said, how do we trust the Crown, how do we trust the recidivist abuser of sexual abuse,
29	emotional abuse, spiritual abuse, physical abuse, ongoing torture to promise that they're
30	going to make a change, and some people have said it must stop. Maybe we need to stop it
31	today. Maybe every site in the country needs to close its doors and do a bit of reflection
32	around the harm they have caused, the generational harm that has been caused.

I think that tangata whenua services need to be supported to employ survivors who

have lived experience of care to the prison, and not sack them because they've had the

33

34

experience, but learn from it. And we've talked all, you know, there's been many who have spoken before me and talked about the lived experience of survivors. It's not about saying "good on you fullas for saying that", it's about creating the space for survivors, ngā mōrehu, ngā purapura ora, whatever terms we give them, whatever those terms are. It's about creating the space so they can hold their own space, design their own healing, with all of the resources that the Crown uses to abuse our tamariki and our whānau with.

I think about this, ma te pa te tamaiti e whakatipu, it takes a village to raise a child. We have many Māori villages throughout the country, some of them are in urban settings, some of them are in rural settings. Some of them are still crying for their babies to be returned home. So, I think about that in the context of the deficit lens that our people are constantly seen through. Tupua and Gary have talked about that. Others as well.

--We so easily have the word "racism" rolls off our tongue, but if we go underneath racism we have this xenophobic belief, approach, attitude that our people do not know what's good for them, that we don't know what's good for ourselves. I'm not saying that some of us, you know, that there are some whānau who need care and protection, or some tamariki who need care and protection. But that doesn't mean their whānau are incapable. There seems to be this whole focus on the end, picking a child up, putting them in care, it's all about crisis prevention. What happened to intervention, what happened to education?

There does need to be changes in legislation. I'm not going to go through all of the legislation, things that need to be changed, but part of those changes need to be based on restoring and giving back to tamariki who can no longer have access to their whenua because they were adopted, taken from their whānau, then adopted by somebody and then they can't whakapapa, or they can whakapapa but they mightn't be able to return to their whenua.

There's a whole range of legislative changes that need to occur. Not to make the Crown look good, but to give back to whānau, hapū and iwi what is truly theirs. And it is about the restoration of mana, but it's giving whānau, hapū and iwi the space to restore their mana, to reclaim those their way. The Crown can't do that.

And like I said before, the Crown must give back whakapapa and it must stop trying to translate it and tell whānau what their whakapapa is. This happens, it's not like I dreamt it up. Just like I heard a term the other day about "trackers". My understanding, we've had social workers in Child Youth and Family Services (CYFS), who have now renamed themselves Oranga Tamariki, which doesn't fit the picture, call themselves now

"whakapapa trackers". That's got to stop too. What gives them the right to someone else's whakapapa? What gives them the right to reframe whakapapa and to bastardise it?

Bastardise it so they can then use that whakapapa to support keeping children away from their whānau, not returning them back to their kuia, koro, mamas, papas.

1 2

I think for the Commission, one of the biggest challenges that I think the Commission has, and each Commissioner, is not to reframe the truth that you have heard to make it comfortable for the Crown to continue doing what it's doing. If we understand the impact of all of the abuses that we've heard, we know the significance of having a voice and allowing that voice to lead itself into its own healing process, into the light.

And it is about allowing our people to have their tangi and through the process reconnect back to tūpuna; however that looks for each whānau, for ngā mōrehu, for ngā purapura ora, for our whānau. But I still get back to the deep disregard in the system, the xenophobic approaches that it has to our wāhine and our tamariki. It is through us that every single person walking on this earth is born; male and female. And guess what, guess who they go back to when they die? Wāhine.

So there's a whole process of restoration that needs to occur and the Crown has no power or authority over that restoration process. And as Tupua said, the Crown has all of the resources, it's not the connecter of whakapapa, it's not the restorer of mana, but it has the resources to support whānau, hapū and iwi move through their own process. I'll just leave it there, Tracey.

PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora Denise. I'll move to you, Hera, for your words to close.

MS CLARKE: Tēnā koe. Tēnā hoki koe, e te māreikura, e Denise. Nāu nei tonu e whakatakototia i ngā kōrero, hei aha? Kia whakawhitiwhiti kōrero mai te tīmatanga. Nō reira, tēnā hoki koe.

[English: thank you also to you, Denise, it was you who furnished the testament for dialogue should have occurred from the start.]

I want to just read a response that we listened to this week and it reads "the Crown left many tamariki in the care of monsters", e tuku a te Karauna kia noho ngā tamariki i roto i ngā kainga o ngā taniwha kīkino [English: the Crown allowed for children to stay with monsters.] Generations of mōrehu are fighting back these monsters and their representatives, including the State who are now being held accountable, who are being made accountable mō ēnei mahi hē [English: for these sinful acts].

And it strikes me as I think about one of the comments that was made from our morehu that by talking about secrets we take away its power. Nohinohi ngā kupu, ēngari

nui atu te huarahi ō ēnei kōrero [English: very little words with huge meaning.] We talk about those secrets and as I recall being spoken about, and when we listen to the mōrehu talk about this, you could see, you saw, you witnessed just what an empowering space that gave him, just to be able to tell his secrets, you know? And he came from a very angry space and yet continued to give generosity, continued to express a willingness to help, a willingness to look at a pathway.

So by talking about your secrets, we take away its power. Whānau are fighting the systemic influence by calling out the institutional racism. Māmā noa iho ēnei kōrero, mōhio ai ngā kaumātua, Te Rangihau mā, i ēnei tūmomo āhua. Kua hoki mai anō mātou ki tēnei kōrero, kua hoki mai, kua hoki mai

[English: It's very simple, the elders knew, Te Rangihau and them, they knew of these circumstances. We've come back to this very same issue.]

There's been so much written, there's so much written about Pūao-Te-Ata-Tū and its recommendations and its many recommendations, and still we come back to this place of kōrero.

I want to also acknowledge Judge Joe Williams, maranga ake ai, maranga ake ai (arise). A call to action is maranga ake ai. You know, judiciary talked about this in depth for many years. And then we have our other whānaunga from Ngāti Porou, Te Ao Mārama, ngā mahi o Te Ao Mārama (English: the workings of the world of light). What are we doing? What are and how do we continue to uplift this institutional racism, kanui tēnei, kanui tēnei (that's quite enough).

We have great leaders amongst us. Many of them are never mentioned, they're the unsung heroes. But there are many. Maranga ake mai e te iwi, ka nui tēnei [English: arise people, that's enough.] Denise mentioned earlier about our aunty, our kuia of Te Rarawa, not one more acre. We continue to say and I remember in, I think it was 1914 at a hui in Waitangi, Paihia, we talked about not one more mokopuna. And here we are in 2022 kī pai, kī pai ngā mokopuna e taka ana i roto i tēnei ngangara e kai ana [English: it is full, the system is full with children being eaten alive by this monster.]

I just want to round up by making some very quick observations, because I know that time is upon us; to say kia ora to our panel, Paora, Denise, Tupua, Gary. It's been my absolute hōnore, (it's been my honour to sit with you, this humble person from Te Aupouri, Te Tai Tokerau and Ngāti Porou and I pray for you, and I'm honoured to work with you. Therefore, acknowledgments and thank you to the team. Over to you Gary).

1	MR WILLIAMS: Thank you. I've got to say that I'm concerned this will be misunderstood or
2	misinterpreted again. Lots of people are involved in the systems that keep us down. I'm
3	thinking about this. Ableism gets us into a position where we're lost and left behind.
4	I need to know that you understood what it means and we need to hear and be confident
5	that you know what we've said so things will change. We don't want to have the same
6	conversations in 25 years. He wants to see that there's outcomes for people before he dies,
7	so please hurry up.
8	MS MOYLE: It's already been said, so just leveraging of what our mate has said, Gary; I've read
9	all the reports that the Royal Commission have put out so far, you know, that might be that
10	little bit of academic in me. But what I'm seeing missed, and seriously missed right across
11	all the reports, is there's no intersectionality. You have to get that right. You have to be able
12	to talk about colonisation, racism, sexism, classism, ableism and the layers, what that
13	means and how it impacts all of those that come to the fore like that. If you don't, you're
14	not getting it right. And it has a direct impact on the way in which our mamas and their
15	new babies are targeted.
16	The other thing that I want to mention is don't forget faith-based organisations, Hato
17	Petera, Hato Paora (St Peter's, St Paul's) and everything that happened in there, you also
18	have to address that and I'm not seeing it enough. Our own harmed our own.

And our LGBTQI community, our takatāpui who were thrown out of their whānau who were put into psychiatric care because they weren't enough or more like the others, or what societal expectations, the norms were. I'm not hearing their voice enough throughout the Royal Commission's inquiries. That's it from me, kia ora everyone. Go Tupua.

MR URLICH: Kia ora. I was wondering if I can ask a pātai to the Chair, Caoral Shaw?

MS MESSITER: Go for it. 24

19

20

21

22

23

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

MR URLICH: Kia ora. I have a few quick pātai. My first pātai is that given what we've heard over the past couple of weeks, would you agree that the monitoring or the oversight of our care system is crucial moving forward?

COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koe Tupua, I'm not sure if Coral is able to comment. Can I speak on her behalf because we talk about this a lot amongst the Commissioners. That this is a very important kaupapa, of course, because in practically every morehu that comes to give evidence before us there are issues of complaint process, of advocacy support for survivors, and the need for independent monitoring of Social Welfare practice and caregivers to ensure that tamariki are safe in care. Kei te pai?

1	MR URLICH: Yeah, and just on that then, will the Royal Commission stand with survivors,
2	calling for the Government to pause their progress on the oversight of Oranga Tamariki bill
3	until the Royal Commission mahi is completed? And if not then what is the purpose of the
4	Royal Commission of Inquiry?
5	COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Kia ora Tupua. This is, as I said, to emphasise, this is a high
6	priority for us, because it is one of what we call the golden threads that we have seen across
7	generations, right back to pre-1950 through to 1999 and beyond. We see that monitoring is
8	a critical issue. And we are aware of the bill and we are aware of the great work that has
9	been done like the organisations that you work with, with VOYCE Whakarongo Mai. We
0	are hearing about the clear criticisms about lack of independence and lack of Māori
1	involvement in the preparation of the legislation. That's the challenge that is with us at this
12	tēpu and we need to think and talk about what the Commission can do in this space. But
13	I hear the challenge from you and it's loud and clear to us, but it's on the Inquiry amongst
4	ourselves here to respond.
15	MR URLICH: So, sorry, I don't actually hear an answer.
6	COMMISSIONER ERUETI: E hoa, this falls within our terms of reference, so we need to
17	collectively as an Inquiry work out how we can intervene and what we can say in this
8	particular space. So we have had several wananga with experts on the kaupapa of
9	independence monitoring, so we've been receiving feedback. We have watched and seen all
20	the submissions that have been made on the bill, so now the mahi lives with us, e hoa, so
21	we have work to do as you've recognised, so now we just need to work out collectively
22	amongst ourselves about what can be said.
23	MR URLICH: Thank you.
24	COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Kia ora.
25	PROF McINTOSH: Kia ora. Before I hand back to the Commission, I know that it will come
26	back to us just for us to close. I just want to just speak about what an honour it has been to
27	sit in this space that you've allowed me to sit in the space. I recognise the mātauranga, the
28	deep knowledge that comes from experience and being experts of their own condition and
29	recognise the love that holds this together. So really just want to acknowledge your
30	leadership and your praxis.
31	So I'll now hand to the Commission, to you Anaru, and I think it will come back to
32	us just to close. Kia ora.
33	COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koe Professor McIntosh. Kua tae tātou ki te mutunga o tō

tātou wānanga ināianei. Me mihi ki a koutou katoa kua eke nei me ō koutou whakaaro

rangatira, ahakoa he kaupapa taumaha. Haere ake ana tērā te moemoeā. Kia eke pānuku.

[English: We have come to the end of this session. Full acknowledgments to you all who furnished your great contributions and the dream continues to fulfil all your wishes.] So we have listened closely to the reflections and thoughts and deep whakāro that have come from our panel of experts. I'm not going to summarise any of the key points. I don't think I could do justice to that, only to know that we have been listening and recording everything, and we appreciate all the thought and time that has gone into preparing these reflections for our Inquiry.

It is so good to have at the end of our Inquiry a list of experts with lived experience and deep experience and working as advocates for survivors and in the Care and Protection system. We're indebted to you all to have your advice and whakāro, and I know it's not easy for you and it hasn't been easy for you, and I know it's been a tough time. But I just want to extend my aroha to each and every one of you for your mahi and your dedication and aroha to tangata Māori and to this kaupapa.

What I will say, though, is that what is clear is that the system continues. The system continues and the State is not listening. It is not listening, there is talk and no action, they've not adapted anything, they have not learned lessons from what has gone, the wrongs that have happened in the past, and it needs to stop. This is what we've been hearing. It needs to stop, and we want transformational change. And I'm hearing from you that this is an urgent kaupapa, you know, from you Paora- that --

MS MOYLE: Survivor led.

COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Survivor led, and Paora you're saying it needs to happen in our lifetime, Tupua you lift up your tamariki and you say time is now and this is an urgent kaupapa. We have got our big ears on, we have been listening to that and it's loud and clear for this Inquiry.

We've also heard about by Māori for Māori and the constant reference back to Pūao-Te-Ata-Tū and the core clear principles that were expressed in there many, many decades ago.

MS CLARK(?): Only three.

COMMISSIONER ERUETI: We've heard about the need for the Crown to step back and allow Māori to step in; Māori as the experts in this space; Māori who are capable of doing this mahi. So, these are some of the core principles that I personally have taken away from our session this morning. But it's been rich with whakaaro and thought and ideas and

suggestions and will keep us, this Inquiry, thinking about it for many, many days and weeks to come ahead of us as we think about the mahi ahead.

So I want to extend my gratitude to you on behalf of the Inquiry to each and every one of you for your time. I want to thank also you, Professor McIntosh. I'm not sure where you are in the world right now but I think it might be in the middle of the night wherever you are, and I want to thank you for your humility and for your mana and your aroha for our people. I know all the mahi that you do, including the mahi that you do for Māori women in prison, you've taken time out from your important mahi to tautoko this work, so ka nui te mihi atu ki a koe (huge acknowledgments to you).

So ka nui te mihi ki a koutou katoa, [English: and to you all I will close with a supporting song,] we're going to close with a waiata tautoko. We're going to come back to - kapai-, back to the panel.

PROF McINTOSH: Tēnā koe Anaru and indeed to all of the Commissioners, thank you. It was the desire of the panel to finish as we started hearing from a survivor. This is a young woman who moved from the care, the pipeline we've been talking about, from care to prison, and she really gifts this to us as her koha. She has made a few changes in this poem, and so this will be what we finish with. So I do want to honour all of the mōrehu, those that have spoken, those who are yet to speak, I want to honour this young woman who her pen name is Maia, and the great love that she has for all of us.

"Broken hearts fear the loudest, a survivor's tears fall the hardest. Broken bones can always heal, but words seep in and remain painful to feel. Trapped souls struggle in the arms of hell, but in this cell the walls never tell. Broken dreams reveal a forgotten call, yet a scream doesn't seem to be heard at all. Surrendered in the heart of hate, the devil inside never turns up late. Broken roads lead to a complete end, a survivor's journey is always just around the bend. Living life only to die inside, the broken and tainted heart I hide. The worst thing in life that you never see is being captured, having never been free. The deepest and the darkest places to be, waiting for the system to release me. Killing innocence and hope but not the pain, or the mass devastation caused with only me left to blame. No one to love and no one to hear, the patient and the addiction to fear. Awaiting for life to begin and start, this is the journey, the journey of my heart."

Kia ora tātou.

COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koe, whaea, for your kupu. A perfect way to complete our panel discussion today with words directly from survivors. So now we've completed our -- kua tae mai ki te mutunga o tēnei wāhanga [English: this session has now come to an end.]

Thank you again to our panel discussion for your articulate and thoughtful advice and reflections on the past two weeks of korero from our survivors. We are now going to pass to the lunch break now, so we're going to break now until 2.15, we're back at 2.15 as per usual, kia ora koutou. Hoki mai ano.

Lunch adjournment from 1.08 pm to 2.39 pm

COMMISSIONER STEENSON: Kia ora ano tātou. Welcome back. We're now going to go to hear a message from our Inquiry survivor representative Tu Chapman.

(Video played).

MS CHAPMAN: (Te reo Māori - Tēnā koutou katoa, ko Tu Chapman tōku ingoa, he uri ahau nō Ngāti Kahungunu ki Heretaunga, nō Ngāti Awa ki Rangitaiki, nō Taranaki me Tūwharetoa Whānui.

[English greetings one and all, my name is Tu Chapman. I'm a descendant of Ngāti Kahungunu ki Heretaunga, Ngāti Awa ki Rangitaike, Taranaki and Tūwharetoa]. I am a member of the survivor advisory group of experts for the Royal Commission of Inquiry into Abuse in Care.

The three main reflections for me from the hearing that is currently happening at Tumutumuwhenua Ōrākei marae: One of those reflections for me has been the strength and courage of survivors that have shared their experiences of abuse in care with their whānau, hapū and iwi supporting them. I think it has been tremendously hard for survivors to be able to come forward and share those experiences of abuse whilst they've been in care.

The second part for me has been the evidence that has been presented and there is a clear line of sight across the trauma that survivors have suffered, the abuses that they've experienced and the amount of mamae that some of those survivors, if not the majority of them, still hold. And I think if we don't acknowledge that as survivors ourselves but also as society, we can't move forward, and I think that strength and that resilience from survivors needs to be noted.

The Māori hearing is probably one of the largest hearings that this Inquiry will undertake, and it will be one of the largest hearings that Māori survivors will have in this lifetime. We're never ever going to have the opportunity to do that again. And as a survivor myself, I can only imagine the people that have not been able to step up and come forward, those who are no longer here, might be feeling about this process if they had been involved. So I think the continuation of allowing survivors to continue to share their stories has to continue.

But it has been a hard journey for us as Māori survivors to even have our experiences received, let alone heard. I mean we've had other listening services, we've had other avenues where we can share our experiences, but none that actually hold the institutions to account. We're not talking about the individuals, we're talking about the institutions. And in this respect, you know, the blame lays squarely with the State. And at the end of the day how much more do we have to keep yelling that from the top of the mountain before it's actually acknowledged. And if this hearing, and the other hearings that will continue to happen with the Inquiry, is an opportunity for us to do that, then we're

I mean there is a big push at the moment to change the care system in New Zealand, and if this is one part to be able to do that, then we have to at least try. We cannot give up, and Māori survivors cannot give up on the fact that they have their own power. Kei a rātou to rātou ake mana motuhake, kei a rātou anō hoki te tino rangatira kia tū tika i roto i tēnei ao. [English: They have the power, they have their own autonomy to stand correct in this world], so that they can then be the masters of their own destiny, whatever that might look like.

going to run with it with both hands and just run forward with it and try and get a result.

Kāore e kore me mihi ka tika ki a koutou i tūkinotia i roto i te atawhaitanga o te Kāwanatanga me ngā whare o te whakapono. Mei kore ake ko koutou, ko koutou ngā mōrehu, ngā purapura ora me kī. Koutou kua taumahatia i roto i ēnei wā, e mihi ana ki a koutou. Kia kaha, kia māia, kia manawanui ka tika

[English: No doubt I must acknowledge you all who were abused in State care and faith-based care. We're really fortunate to you, the survivors, to you who have been burdened throughout the years. Thank you all, be stouthearted and be strong.]

COMMISSIONER STEENSON: Tēnā koe Tu, e mihi ana ki a koe kua puta mai [English: I'd like to acknowledge your words of expression.] Thank you for your message, and it's right that we hear from the Inquiry survivor rōpū, as we heard from them at the beginning of this hearing, to hear from them at the close.

I just want to acknowledge our other members of that Rōpū. Matua Gary Williams who we heard today as part of the panel, Kararaina Beckett who spoke at the opening of the hearing, and Tu Chapman that we just heard from. Also Jim Goodwin, Keith Wiffin, Frances Tagaloa and Rupene Amato.

I'm now going to ask Commissioner Erueti to introduce our Taumata.

(Video played).

COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Kia ora anō. It's a great honour for me to be able to introduce	
Shirley Ikkala, professional teaching fellow from the University of Auckland and a memb	ber
of Te Taumata Ropū in this short video piece, kia ora.	

MS IKKALA: Ko Māungakiekie te maunga, ko Waitematā te moana, Ko Ngāti Whātua te iwi, ko Ngā Oho, ko te Taoū, ko Uringutu ngā hapū, ko Ōrākei te marae, ko Tuperiri te tangata. [English: Maungakiekie is the mountain, Waitematā is the harbour, Ngāti Whātua is the tribe Ngā Oho, Te Taoū, Te Uringutu are the subtribes, Ōrākei is the marae, Tuperiri is the ancestor.] My name is Shirley Ikkala, I am an uri of this whenua and a member of Taumata, a pou Māori rōpū advising the Royal Commission.

I stand here at Takaparawhau where Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei faced one of our biggest challenges 45 years ago in 1977, when we occupied Bastion Point. Our strength, resilience and courage were tested but we had to stand for our rights. The times were hard, but we held firm to ensure the wellbeing of our mokopuna and generations to come.

Therefore, it is fitting that our closing reflections are delivered from this whenua, Takaparawhau where we stood together, just as we have stood with ngā purapura ora, with survivors throughout the Māori public hearing. Tumutumuwhenua, our ancestral whare, has been the korowai holding the kōrero of ngā purapura ora. Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei has welcomed the Royal Commission to Tumutumuwhenua to provide a safe environment for survivors to share ngā kōrero.

Throughout the Māori public hearing we have heard the powerful truths and the lived experiences of abuse, neglect, racism and injustice experienced by Māori survivors. Many of them are now kaumātua.

State and faith-based institutions tried to erase their whakapapa, which is our intrinsic right as Māori handed down to us by our tūpuna. The hearing has been a significant moment in time for us as Māori, for Māori survivors and their whānau, for the nation and for our future. As Māori we acknowledge the survivors who are no longer with us. Their voices live on in the kōrero of the survivors who remain. We must never forget the voices and faces of the brave survivors who have shared their mamae and hopes with us. We must all the listen with open hearts to their words of kaha, māia and manawanui. We must never forget their hurt.

But what gives me strength is we've also heard from survivors about a pathway forward. Now we must act as one, to change what they have told us needs to change. Many survivors are still suffering. Despite the good that has been done and the courageous steps

they have taken; for so many the mamae will never end. My message to survivors is, while we couldn't host you in person here at our beautiful marae, when Covid and tikanga allows, our doors will be open to all of you and your whānau when you wish to be here with us.

We stand with you. Never let the voices of our mokopuna be silenced. It is our duty, tiaki me ngā mokopuna me ngā whānau, hapū me ngā iwi katoa, nō reira, tēnā rā koutou, tēnā koutou, tēna tātou katoa

[English: to look after our mokopuna, our subtribes and all our tribes. Therefore thank you all.]

COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koe, e ngā rangatira, e ngā pūkenga o Te Taumata. Mauria m ai ō koutou mana, ō koutou whakapono, ō koutou tikanga ki waenganui i a mātou. Hei māramatanga mō te ao. Tēnā koe, kei te mihi atu ki a koe whaea, me ō kōrero kaha. [English: to the chiefly and esteemed assembly who bring to us all your skills and expertise and experiences in terms of us understanding more, I would like to acknowledge you, whaea.]

I want to thank you for coming forward and speaking on behalf of Te Taumata before our Inquiry. Te Taumata is such a vital part of this Inquiry. We couldn't do this as Commissioners without your support, particularly Julia and I. I want to acknowledge the tautoko that Te Taumata provides for us as the Māori Commissioners and giving us advice on Te Tiriti and tikanga and just keeping us safe and secure and focused on the mahi ahead of us.

All the Te Taumata members have deep experience in this kaupapa, including Shirley Ikkala. The other members include Prue Kapua who is Chair, Liz Mellish from Te Atiawa. We also have former members I want to acknowledge, Sharon Hawke who provided advice to the Inquiry for a long, long time, also from Ngāti Whātua, ngā mihi mahana ki a koe e te rangatira kei te maumaharatia mātou i to tātou hoa pūmau, matua, rangatira Neville Baker.

[English: warm thanks to you. I also recall our good friend Neville Baker] who provided us with strong, solid advice, particularly on redress when we were preparing our redress report. So I want to mihi to Neville Baker and his whānau too, ka nui te pai.

We're going to take a brief 5 minute adjournment while we sort out some technical issues whānau. Back soon.