## ABUSE IN CARE ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY MĀORI HEARING

Under The Inquiries Act 2013

In the matter of The Royal Commission of Inquiry into Historical Abuse in

State Care and in the Care of Faith-based Institutions

**Royal Commission:** Ms Julia Steenson

Dr Anaru Erueti Mr Paul Gibson Judge Coral Shaw

Ali'imuamua Sandra Alofivae

Counsel: Ms Julia Spelman, Mr Kingi Snelgar, Mr Wiremu Rikihana,

Mr Luke Claasen, Ms Maia Wikaira, Ms Alisha Castle, Ms Tracey Norton, Ms Season-Mary Downs, Ms Alana Thomas, Mr Winston McCarthy, Mr Simon Mount QC,

Ms Kerryn Beaton QC for the Royal Commission

Ms Melanie Baker, Ms Julia White

and Mr Max

Clarke-Parker for the Crown Mr James Meagher for the Catholic Church Ms Fiona Guy Kidd for the Anglican Church Ms Sonya Cooper, Ms Amanda Hill as other

counsel attending

Venue: Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei Tumutumuwhenua Marae

59b Kitemoana Road

Ōrākei

**AUCKLAND** 

**Date:** 16 March 2022

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

## **INDEX**

MR MM	
Questioning by Ms Spelman	550
Questioning by Commissioners	575
NATASHA KAYLENE HINERU EMERY	
Questioning by Ms Norton	582
Questioning by Commissioners	610

1	COM	IMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koutou katoa, nau mai haere mai, welcome back to our next
2		session. I'm just going to check with our tech people that we're all good. Thumbs up, over
3		there. Kapai.
4		I want to note also that our Commissioners are watching remotely, that includes
5		Commissioners Steenson, Shaw, Alofivae and Gibson. We now have counsel Mr Luke
6		Claasen here from our Māori Investigation Team to introduce the evidence for our next
7		survivor, Ms Emery. Tēnā koe, Mr Claasen.
8	MR	CLAASEN: Tēnā koe e te tiamana, otirā koutou katoa, ngā Kōmihana kua piri mai, e
9		whakarongo mai ana ki ēnei o ngā kōrero. E tautoko ana i ngā mihi kua mihia i te rā nei ki
10		tō tātou nei Matua nui i te rangi. Ka huri ngā mihi ki tō tātou nei Kīngi a Kīngi Tūheitia anō
11		hoki, e noho ana ki te ahurewa tapu o ōna mātu tūpuna, Tēnei au ka mihi.
12		[English: and those of the Commissioners who have joined also. I want to support all the
13		acknowledgments made to our creator, I want to acknowledge our Māori king, Kingi
14		Tuheitia who resides on the throne of his ancestors.]
15		Ka huri ngā mihi ki a rātou mā kua whetūrangitia me te karanga atu ki a rātou kia hoki
16		wairua mai roto ki tēnei o ngā whare. Ko Jason tērā. Ākuanei, ka rongo i ngā kōrero mōna.
17		Tēnei au te mihi atu kia ia, haere, haere, hoki atu rā.
18		[English: I want to acknowledge those who have passed and call upon them to
19		return spiritually to us in our house, it is Jason, you will hear the narrative about him.
20		I acknowledge him, farewell.]
21		Kia tātou kua whakaika mai ki tēnei whare i te kaupapa o tēnei rā, tēnā tātou katoa.
22		[English: To all that have gathered today in this house, for our proceedings today,
23		greetings to us all.]
24		He purapura ora, he māra tipu. Ahakoa kua takahia te purapura, ka riro tētahi
25		wahanga ōna. He pitomata mutunga kore tōna, hei tipu, hei whanake. Ko koe tērā e whaea
26		Natasha Emery. Tēnei au ka mihi atu ki a koe.
27		[English: Survivor, a flower that has blossomed, although crushed, it can survive
28		and bloom and blossom once more. That is, you, Whaea Natasha Emery. I acknowledge
29		you.]
30		Mr Chair, Commissioners, I appear before you to introduce Ms Natasha Emery.
31		Natasha, can you confirm that you're connected with us at this time?
32	A.	Āe.
33	Q.	Kia ora, just to confirm, you'd like to be referred to as whaea or Ms Emery?
34	A.	Ms Emery is fine, thank you.

1	Q.	Tēnā koe, Ms Emery. And I'll just get an indication that our pre-recorded evidence is ready
2		to go before I pass back to our chair. Kapai.
3		Tēnā koe e te Heamana (thank you, Mr Chairman). I pass back to you, Mr Chair, to
4		affirm Ms Emery's written evidence.
5	CON	MMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koe, Mr Claasen. Ms Emery, now for the affirmation.
6		NATASHA KAYLENE HINERU EMERY (Affirmed)
7	QUE	STIONING BY MR CLAASEN: Tēnā koe tturu. (Thank you, Mr Chair.
8		I'll give you one last opportunity, Ms Emery, if you'd like to add anything,
9		otherwise we'll now move to your pre-recorded evidence.
10		Do you have any further comments at this stage, Ms Emery?
11	A.	Kao (no).
12	Q.	Tēnā koe.
13		If we could now, please play the pre-recorded evidence and just to indicate, we will
14		be having a break -at 3.15?
15	CON	AMISSIONER ERUETI: Perhaps 3.30, about an hour into the evidence I think would be
16		good, thank you, Mr Claasen.
17	MR	CLAASEN: Tēnā tātou.
18		(Video played).
19	QUE	STIONING BY MS NORTON: Kia ora, koutou, we are here in Kihikihi, it's 8 February
20		2022 and we are recording the evidence of Natasha Emery.
21		I would like to start this recording with you, Tash, but if I could get you to say some
22		opening comments I would be grateful.
23	A.	Yeah. (Te reo Māori Ngai te Rangi and Ngai Te Ranginui are my tribes, Poutūterangi is
24		my marae, Pirirakau is my hapū, is my subtribe), ko te Uri tuarua o Te Arawa, ko
25		Waikohatu te marae, Ngāti Tarawhai te hapū, ko Tuhakaraina rāua ko Malcolm ōku
26		whanau whānui.
27		My full name is Natasha Kaylene Hineru Emery. I was born on redacted I have
28		two siblings, my eldest brother Jason and my middle -brother redactedMy father later
29		had two more sons redacted I live in Te Awamutu and work as a National Programme
30		Manager for the Bachelor of Bicultural Social Work degree programme
31		I have one son, James, and a daughter redacted my husband and I have also been
32		the whāngai parents to several children.
33	Q.	Natasha, you would like to make some opening comments?

- A. Just in relation to why I've chosen to be a part of this process. As I talk about my brother and I, this is our story, it's our journey. My brother is no longer here to be able to share his journey and I feel absolutely privileged that I'm able to be in this space to do so for him as well as for myself. And there is the hope that from our story there will be change within the system in the way in which we look after our vulnerable children in Aotearoa New Zealand. Kia ora.
- Q. Kia ora. Can I get you to elaborate on paragraph 1.4 but also your PhD topic that you're currently completing. Not only do you have lived experience in State care, you also have practical and academic experience. Can you talk to that, please?
- A. Kapai. I have a Bachelor of Bicultural Social Work; I have a Master's in Indigenous

  Studies as well as post grad in professional supervision. I have an extensive social work
  background working in the disability and youth sector as well as Care and Protection.
- In front of you you have a copy of your statement that's been provided to the Inquiry and that statement is taken as read today. There will be four parts to your korero today. The first part we will talk about the circumstances leading up to you coming into care; then we will move to the second part which is your time in care and the impacts of that on you; then we will talk about your experience with the historical claims process and your own reflections on how that process can be improved; and we will finish on some reflections, personal reflections, and some closing comments.
- 20 A. Kapai.
- Q. Let's start with the circumstances leading into you coming into care. For the first five years of your life, you were brought up by your grandparents. Can you talk about that, please, and then we will move on to paragraph 3, the Savage Years.
- A. A kapai. So yes, I was raised by my grandparents redacted-. My parents separated within a year of my birth, and my brother Jason and I were raised by our paternal grandparents.

  My middle brother -redacted was-- with his other grandparents. They provided- a loving and stable home. We didn't know any type of violence, abuse, all we knew is that we were happy, and we were loved at that time, and I just started school when we left.
- 29 **Q.** So, if we can move to paragraph 3 of your affidavit headed "The Savage Years". Can you tell us about that, but particularly why you've named it that?
- A. Yes, so we went to live with our father, and I must point out that we didn't really have any type of relationship with him or our new stepmother. We weren't at their wedding, we didn't know what that even was at the time, and we moved to Tokoroa.

Life was okay for the first few months and then our stepmother became quite nasty, withholding food if we did something wrong, a lot of the time we didn't actually know what that wrong was. My father built an outside shed, and we were pretty much banished into that space for a long time. So, they put our beds out there, we had a little TV, and we could only access the house if we needed to use the toilets, have a kai, or bathe ourselves.

There is also a park directly behind the house, which we were made to go and play in pretty much every day. So, by all means we weren't welcome in the house space at all during those times.

Our stepmother would tell our father things that we had supposedly done which would anger him and then turn into redacted more-- so for my brother than myself and I believe that that was mainly because I was female. And my stepmother especially hated my brother Jason. -I have a I- really don't know why, that's something that she would have to deal with as she's- now passed, so as-- a five-year old- to, I think, 12-year-old while we were living in Tokoroa I saw a number of redacted that-- my brother got. -But also, being a vulnerable female, I was too scared to stop it in case I received the same. But all I could do was clean his wounds and talk to him and comfort him the best that I could.

We pretty much only had each other while we were in that space.

However, our grandparents would come every weekend and they would come and pick us up and that was probably the highlight of our Fridays, knowing that they were coming and as soon as we saw their car in the driveway we would be running, because we knew we were going somewhere safe, and we'd go somewhere where we would be loved.

We did -I did tell my grandmother what was happening in the home, especially one point where my father had -redacted-- - my grandmother then went and made a disclosure to Department of Social Welfare at the time and due to that we didn't see our grandparents for a year. That was probably one- of the hardest years we ever had to endure not having them in our lives, especially as that social worker had told us they would not relay where the notification had come from, but they did, hence why we never got to see them for that year.

I call them The Savage Years mainly because that was probably the that- was the really bad times. And as vulnerable children, we couldn't defend ourselves, and there was no one, apart from our grandparents, that would defend us, regardless of what was going on in the home-.

We are aware that Social Welfare were in the space. However, it was more according- to my files it was more in relation to my stepmother and her health, not so much

our behaviours, but she learned how to work with us, and I think that's- where a lot of it got misconstrued, it was never about a family unit, it was all individualised at the time.

- **Q.** So, there's a period of time where you went and moved to the far north?
- 4 A. Yes.

- **Q.** That's a time when you and Jason were separated. Can you talk to us about that?
- A. Yes. So, we left Tokoroa, I was in my first year of intermediate, and my brother was
  first year of college. We didn't know we were leaving. They pretty much told us the day
  before we had to start packing and we moved to Te Kopuru which is about 10 minutes past
  Dargaville.

We were in a farm cottage there and then my father and his wife separated, and we went with our father and was living at Pahi Beach which is, I think, 5Ks just out of Paparoa. We lived in a tiny little bach and my brother and I were both enrolled at Otamatea High School in Maungateroto.

My father didn't believe in Government benefits, therefore he just went and got some jobs here and there to try and pay the bills, I guess. So, we lived on oysters which were all around the sea line at the time and lived in this bach, the three of us together.

There redacted in-- that time but that was more focused on my brother than it was on me at the time. But after a year I was sent to live with my stepmother, my brother remained with my father, and that's when I was enrolled at Te Kopuru School. While my stepmother, she didn't redacted- me--, it was more the -redacted that-- I endured each day. -I always wonder why she even wanted me to go back and live there, to be honest, due to that.

And then during that time my father and Jason had an altercation and Jason was removed from his care. My father then came and lived back with us for a, I don't know how long redacted started-- again. -He hit me across the face with a spatula because I said I- was giggling and saying something to my little -half-brother. And that was, -I think that was the catalyst for me, I'd had enough, I couldn't do it anymore, I was scared of him, no one was helping us, we lived in the middle of nowhere, so I rang my grandparents and then they came and got me-.

- **Q.** And that was in 1987, you were 11 years old, and paragraph 3.10 to 3.12 talks about the short period of time that you returned to live with your grandparents. Can you talk to us about that?
- 33 A. Yeah. So, when I went, I-- sort of I- turned 12 during this time, I was enrolled at Te
  34 Awamutu College. I think by this stage I was already a little girl lost and just felt that

nobody gave a damn and at that point of time too that included my grandparents, I'm sad to say. But I just felt that the world- was all against me, so I was going to do whatever I wanted, and I ended up with an attitude of: Well, nobody cares so I'll just do what I want.

So, I put them through a lot, I put them through a lot for that year. But one of the biggest things, and it was something my grandmother always said too, and we had requested, was would the Department of Social Welfare help us with housing, because I was living with my grandparents in a one-bedroom flat and I wasn't actually allowed to be there because they were council flats, but I was there, nonetheless. So, my bedroom was the lounge, with a pull-out bed. I had no space for myself. And I know that my grandmother had asked a number of times if that was a possibility and each time, she was told no.

My grandmother also wrote a letter to Social Welfare, and I found that in the files, where she was asking for help. She wasn't asking for me to be uplifted, I want to point that out. She was asking for help, and that help included housing, as well, and I do believe that they weren't getting any financial assistance for me for quite some time, which wouldn't have helped.

As a 12-yearold girl you don't think of things like that. I -just I- would go and stay with my friends, and we'd be out a lot because that was a space that I felt comfortable in at the time-.

So, I do want to acknowledge my grandparents as I really did put them through a lot during that time.

Okay, I'm unsure of the date, but I remember it was the school holidays and I was walking down the street with my friends, sorry, and a car pulled up beside us. We had no idea who these people were, there were four of them in the car, there were three males and one female. They just crowded me two on each side and they lifted me off the pavement from my shoulders and put me in the car. I was kicking and screaming of course. My friends, absolutely traumatised because they thought these people were coming to kidnap me. I didn't know who they were, I thought they were going to kidnap me. I knew that Social Welfare was involved, but I had no idea that this was going to happen.

And then they took yeah-, so I had no idea at the time, but Social Welfare had applied to the court to make me a State ward. I was angry, hurt, I was an angry, hurt adolescent living in a small -one-bedroom council flat with my grandparents, had no privacy so I wanted to hang out with my friends. All we needed was a bigger home and things would have been much better for us-.

- 1 **Q.** And do you remember how you felt in that car surrounded by social workers?
- 2 A. I was petrified. I think once I figured out who they were, because they didn't readily
- introduce themselves, I think I calmed because I realised, I wasn't being kidnapped per se,
- but I became angry, so I kicked out, I did everything that I could to try and get out of the
- 5 car. But they had one person on each side of me so there was no way that I was going to
- 6 be that-- I was going to be going anywhere during that time.
- 7 **Q.** Do you remember where they took you?
- 8 A. They took me to the first foster home which was on redacted in-- Hamilton. -I walked in
- one door and walked straight out the other and took off down the road and rang my friend
- who met me halfway. They didn't find me, I think, for a day. And then they sent me back.
- But this time my grandparents were with me when they sent me back.
- 12 **Q.** So, at this juncture we start your time in care. And that's detailed at paragraph 4 of your
- statement. Your time in care consisted of three different foster homes, but also several
- stints in Hamilton Girls' Home on Dey Street?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 **Q.** I'll get you to turn to paragraph 4 of your statement and can you talk us through your time
- at the redacted family--- home?
- A. -redacted home-, yeah. -That was my first placement and there was a number of State
- wards that lived there. We were always separated from the family that were there and that
- looked after the home. There were two separate lounges, so there was one for them, one for
- us. Even down to the bedrooms, you went down the hallway to the right was where we
- were all housed, to the left is where their whānau were, that included their own children.
- And there were a lot of their whānau that were in and out of the home as well during that
- time.

28

29

30

32

Yeah, so they would have takeaways for dinner, but we were never included in that.

We didn't receive pocket money or anything like that, so we couldn't even go down to the

shop. We pretty much weren't allowed to leave the property, that's how it was redacted

after-- their own children, but we were made to clean up after ourselves and take

responsibility for our own living space, which I don't think is a bad thing- in terms of taking

responsibility for cleaning up our own space, but it was never a whānau environment in that

31 home, is pretty much what I'm saying.

I never felt safe because redacted touched--- my bottom and it made me feel really

uncomfortable, and I knew it wasn't right and I told my social worker Jani Van Schagen,

but nothing came of my disclosure, and I felt like no one cared-.

I just want to add to that that it took me a long time to be able to get the courage to even tell her, because of the relationship we had already got, which was not a good one. So, by me telling her took a lot and yet she just laughed it off and told me to stop being silly.

I ran back to my grandparents six times in total while in care, but each time I'd be found and each time I would be sent to Dey Street as a punishment before they returned me to redacted-. I do want to add that this was, yeah, I went to Dey Street six times whilst in all three not just sent back -redacted each--- time.

- **Q.** Talk about Dey Street, and that's set out at paragraph 4.5 onwards. Every time you went to Dey Street you were placed in the secure unit?
- 11 A. Yes.

- **Q.** Can you talk about that?
- A. So, the secure unit was everything was steel, they were locked doors, and it was a prison cell for want of another description, and that's from now I've seen what a prison cell looks like. And I remember in my first time that I went there I spent all of my time in there, and that was about a week that I spent in there. And we were when- we were allowed out, it was only into the basketball court area, and there was a little side room off there, but we never, during that first week, I was never put in the bigger unit. I'm not sure if that was due to my age. -That could have been a factor.
- **Q.** What was your age?
- A. I think I would have been 12, 13 at the time. Yeah. But nonetheless, it was still extremely petrifying for a child of my age. The majority of them were older.

The first thing I found out when I walked in there is that you had to have a gang affiliation even if you weren't affiliated anywhere, because it was about the survival of the fittest. Yeah, so I did the thing I- "repped" a side because I didn't know what else to do. -I was never beaten, thank goodness, but I did what I was told, and I didn't question anything from the older girls for fear of being beaten and I was a look-out or a distractor while some of the girls beat on other girls. I knew this was wrong but, you know, it was about survival and if I didn't do it then my turn was going to be next.

- **Q.** What was the role of a lookout or distractor?
- A. That was just to keep an eye out where the staff were and to let the abusers know if anyone was coming.
- And at paragraph 4.7 you talk about there being a lot of violence?
- 34 A. Yeah.

- 1 **Q.** But you also talk about the reaction of the staff Dey Street?
- 2 A. Yeah.
- 3 **Q.** Can you tell us about that?
- A. Yeah, so I was witness to a girl that was really savagely beaten, and when she was found
  I heard one of the staff members say she's being too mouthy or too lippy. She was and- she
  was there for like an hour before any medical aid came to her. She had a broken jaw, two
  black eyes and had lost a few teeth and to my detriment I did nothing. -And I was too
  scared to tell on them for fear of getting a hiding myself, especially seeing that brutality

9 was really frightening.

And they also brought her back from the hospital and placed her back in that environment, which I thought, even at my age I thought was pretty outrageous. But yeah, the staff definitely weren't didn't- seem phased, it was almost like it happened every day, and there was -no I- didn't see any compassion, -any anything- really, which was, you know, on reflection is really, really sad for that girl-.

It's something that I've that's- been ingrained in my mind for many years is that I didn't help her. It's- something that I have to live with.

- 17 **Q.** And we'll talk about the impacts of your time in care very shortly.
- 18 A. Kapai.

10

11

12

13

14

15

- 19 **Q.** But what I do want you to do is actually read the first two sentences of paragraph 4.7.
- A. "There was a lot of violence and the staff either encouraged it, turned a blind eye to it, or did nothing to stop it. I never felt safe. The staff were also abusive and punished us by making us do things like scrub the entire basketball court", which is correct.
- 23 **Q.** So, while in Dey Street you witnessed violence and the staff did nothing to intervene, is that what you're saying?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. At paragraph 4.8 you say that you had four stints in Dey Street --
- 27 A. Yeah.
- 28 Q. and after the fourth stint you didn't go back to -the redacted----
- 29 A. No.
- 30 **Q.** But you were taken to a family home on redacted----
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 **Q.** And that's paragraph 4.9 of your statement.
- 33 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you want to say anything about that foster home?

A. Yes, there was abuse in that foster home, but I will say it was not by both parents, it was by the female caregiver. She was verbally and physically abusive towards me and the other children there. I was slammed up against a wall and I was beaten with a pool cue. Again, I told my social worker, but nothing happened about it.

And but-- there were I-- will say that there were sorry-, there were good times in that foster home as well, due to the connections of the other children. But I will also say again, and this was a social welfare funded home, that we were very separated, so their children had their own rooms, for us State care children, there were four of us in one small room for the girls and four boys in the other room, which we -were so- you felt the separation but at the same time there -were we- did have some good times with us as kids-.

Did you want me to carry on to 4.10?

- Q. At 4.10 you talk about something that the social worker did at the time. Can you talk to us about that?
- A. Yeah, sorry. So, the social worker tried to reconnect me with my mother. I went to stay with her husband, my brother redacted, and--- my younger sister redacted for-- a week in Wellington, and I later found out in my Social Welfare file that my mother had written to my social worker saying she did not want to live with me or did not want me to live with her and so that was just rejection all over again-.

I guess I- have found out through the later years that it was almost like she felt she was being made to come and see- me, not that she actually wanted that relationship at all. However, the social worker never mentioned that.

- **Q.** During your time with redacted- and then with -the redacted- -- did your foster parents or your social worker at the time, did they encourage contact with your grandparents?
- A. So that goes into 4.11. I was allowed to have limited phone calls and limited visits with my grandparents, and I found out later that my grandmother used to try and call me every second night but redacted rarely-- allowed me to talk to her. When I was living at the redacted,- I-- wasn't- allowed to talk on the phone, but I was allowed to go and see my grandparents, but it was very sporadic. They were trying and-- it had been said to me that they were trying to decrease the attachment that I had to my grandmother.
  - **Q.** Who told you that?

- 31 A. The social worker. Because it wasn't healthy.
- Q. What was the impact of them trying to decrease the attachment on you; did it work?
- A. No, it just made me more determined, hence why I ran away, it would be to be with my grandmother.

- 1 **Q.** Do you have a comment on that particular social work practice?
- A. The social work practice itself, well, the social worker that was practising this social work framework, whatever framework she was using, didn't care, she didn't have any empathy and I think any whānau connections that I did have, it was almost like they were trying to detach me from them, knowing full well that my grandmother was my everything at the time and that anything I did when I ran away would always be back to her.

Again, if they had have been able to have offered us a bigger home, this would never have happened.

- 9 **Q.** I'm going to move on to paragraph 4.13 of your statement. You say before that "I was unhappy redacted I--- ran away a few times, but I was always returned back there."
- 11 A. Mmmhmm.

7

- 12 **Q.** Eventually you ended up at a foster home in Nawton. Can you speak to us about that, please?
- A. Yeah, so the foster home redacted in-- Nawton was more a permanent placement, whereas 14 the previous two were family homes funded by the Department-. So, this was about me 15 going to live permanently with these foster parents. And it was nice, I mean they were nice 16 people, you know, I didn't have any abuse there. But I think by that time I was already 17 traumatised, I didn't know what good people looked like either, and it was really hard to 18 distinguish what, you know, them being nice to me, what that actually meant. I was going 19 20 to school at Fraser, and yeah, generally already on a nautical path of self-destruction, but I think at that time is when I got a new social worker -redacted and-- this is, I guess, 21 where -the my-- real life really kicked into gear in terms of lifestyle and things like that. 22
- Q. I'm going to talk about your time with your uncle in Kihikihi. However, I do want to ask you a question about your time in care. During your time in care, how often did you see social workers?
- A. They would come to the house in the family home, so they would pretty- much they would come to see a few of us. -When I had so- Jani van Shagen is probably the- most prominent social worker that I can remember, I probably had her the longest. She I- didn't see her very often, once we were -in unless- something had gone wrong, that's when I would see her, yeah-.
- And did you get a sense that the social workers that you did see had read your file and understood your story --
- 33 A. No.
- 34 **Q.** as to why you were in care?-

- 1 A. No, not at all.
- 2 **Q.** Do you want to comment about that?
- A. Yes, definitely. It's more around, you know, the communication that when you're looking dealing- with a vulnerable child that you know their history and you know their background. I don't believe any of that was read. I also believe that there were some
- entries in there that didn't happen and where they say that they had come to visit me,
- 7 I know that they didn't-.
- 8 Q. So, you're talking about inaccuracies in your DSW file?
- 9 A. Yes.

14

15

16

17

18

19

31

32

33

34

- 10 **Q.** How prolific was that?
- 11 A. I wouldn't say prolific, but there are a number of entries in there that I believe didn't happen.

I guess I can add on to that, too, in terms of some of the reports they put in there right back to when I was a child and they would go and see my grandparent and they would talk about the state of her whare or the state of what she looked like, right down to what she looked like. There had been no research, for want of another word, around their finances. At that time, they had nothing, they weren't getting even a benefit for us, but yet they want to put in the file what the house looked like and what she looked like. I just, yeah, just wanted to add that, very unnecessary.

- Q. I want to talk about the decision that your social worker redacted around-- 1989. That was the decision to place you with your uncle-.
- A. Mmmhmm.
- Q. Can you tell us about your uncle, and you were there for six months. Tell us about your time there over that period?
- A. So, my uncle was the vice-president- of the local Black Power here in Kihikihi, in Te
  Awamutu, so he had visited me when I was in the Nawton home because he was the only
  whānau member. My mother didn't have anything to do with me by that time, and my
  uncle felt that that was unfair and felt that we as this-- included my brother, should have
  some interaction with our immediate whānau. So, we really only knew him probably in
  that immediate whānau at that time.

I ran away one last time and I just need to say there was no reason why I ran away. My friend wanted to run away because she wasn't happy at home, so I went with her, and that's the only reason. It wasn't because something was going on at redacted house--. When I was caught, when I was caught, we were sent upstairs to the Department of Social

Welfare and that's where I met -redacted and-- he asked me if I wanted to live with my uncle, and at that time, I was 14, of course I did-.

I thought he was cool, I thought, you know, that life was going to be great and that finally I had somebody that was going to protect me and who more who- better to protect me than the -vice-president of the Black Power. You can't- get any better than that, so I thought at 14.

So, I was allowed to go and live with him and his partner. I didn't see redacted after-- that. -And my uncle lived in a five-bedroom home, and he lived there with other patch members and their partners-. So, my bedroom was in the same room as him and his partner and we lived there together. So, I was very much exposed to the gang life, which included the parties, the drugs, the violence. My uncle tried to keep me away from as much as he could but when you're all in the same house it's pretty hard to not see things.

I'd been living with my uncle for around six months when he was sentenced to time in prison. And my uncle later passed away in prison. By that time, I was in a relationship with a Black Power gang member, and I was pregnant.

I will never understand why they ultimately placed me with my uncle. As a 14-yearold of course you think -it's that's- great. However, now, as a mother myself, as a grandmother, and as a social worker, a practitioner, there is no way that I would place a child especially of that age being so vulnerable at that time into this space. It only will create that layer of intergenerational trauma and a pathway of gang life, which, as a lot of people will know, is very hard to break from, extremely hard to break from-.

Yeah, that's something that sits with me is how anybody could see that this was a positive outcome. I do believe that they were at their they- had nowhere else to place me, and this was their only choice, and they took it. That's- how I see it.

I know that for redacted talked-- about connections with my whakapapa, which I had no connection with at that time, and so being with my uncle would reconnect that whakapapa. -However, I struggle to understand, and with the experience that I had, the only whakapapa I got was gang life. It wasn't anything to do with whānau. Well, very much a different type of whānau.

- Q. And you say in your statement that you never saw your social worker from the day that you were placed --
- 32 A. No.

1 2

**Q.** -- with your uncle. Do you want to comment about that social work practice?

1 A. Yeah. Again, I'm not sure why that happened. Again, it could have been "Well, we've found her a place, nothing's going wrong so we'll just leave her."

I do know that in my file, and it was raised during the redress, that there is a statement in there that a social worker did come to visit me, but I can categorically say I saw no one. I saw no one after that time. If anything, I sought the services of Matua Whāngai that were here in Te Awamutu, and they are the ones that helped me after my uncle passed away.

You would have thought being 14 and pregnant I would have heard from somebody, I heard from nobody.

- 10 **Q.** Being a ward of the State, you effectively aged out of care early, would that be a correct statement?
- 12 A. Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

- 13 **Q.** Do you want to make a comment about that?
- A. I didn't know any of that process, there was no court process, there was no process to say:

  You are no longer in the care of the State, it just I- just didn't- see anybody.
- 16 **Q.** Knowing your area of expertise now when you reflect back on that time, what should have been the process?
- A. The process should have been that whoever was assigned this person walks beside that person right up until the day that they physically age out, and even beyond that. They should know everything about this person and know how vulnerable they are and what should be put in place in terms of support services in order to help them.
- I'm going to move to the, what is effectively the next stage of your life at paragraph 5. Can you talk to us about that?
- A. Yeah. Okay. So, I miscarried when I was 14, fell pregnant again at 15, and at 16 I gave birth to my son James. During that time, my partner was very abusive. I did little about the abuse, believing that this was how things were meant to be, especially because I was living within the gang culture.
- 28 **Q.** So, your partner was a patch member?
- A. A patch member, mmmhmm, yep. I finally left his father when I was 18 years old and at that time, I needed to leave my son with his grandparents until I could go and sort myself out, find housing. -I actually returned back to Tokoroa during that time. But when I asked for my son to be returned his grandparents refused and they filed for custody of him. And that was a really difficult process for me, and I felt that it wasn't the environment that I wanted him to be raised in, but I knew that he would always be safe and that they did love

him. But I also knew that if I tried to fight it, what that could look like for him and I, which wasn't a positive wouldn't- be a positive experience-.

It's something that I've always regretted, but it's also something that I felt that I had to do for his safety and my safety at the same time and - but James always knew that I was his mother, I supported him financially all of- his life and tried to have the best relationship that I could with what we had at the time.

- **Q.** Can you speak to us about James' story?
  - A. Yeah. James eventually went on to have three children, he actually has four, we found another one, so he has three daughters and one son, and I'm raising his eldest child who's just left for boarding school last week.

My son followed in his father's footsteps and joined a gang, which resulted in drug use and numerous stints in jail. So, I supported him throughout those stages as well, and tried to support his kids as much as I could. But, you know, despite all of that, everyone that knew him knew him to be quite a humble person and did a lot for his friends.

On 22 October redacted had-- him at home for four nights. We had over 400 people attend his tangi. That's a day I'll never be the same. I also believe that the environments that he was placed in didn't help. I possibly will never know the real reason, but as his mother I just hope that by writing my PhD and being a part of this process people will see that the environments that people are placed in while in State care can truly affect future generations-.

- Q. I want to talk about your brother Jason now. You were separated before you went into care?
- 23 A. Yes.

- Q. So, his journey differs from yours, but he's not here to share his story with us today, so that task falls on you. So, I'm going to ask you now to speak about Jason.
- A. Kapai. As I said previously, my father was extremely abusive towards Jason and the abuse got worse during their time together in the far north. One day it finally got too much, and Jason retaliated by hitting our father with the same piece of wood he'd been hitting him with. Jason was 13 years old and Social Welfare turned up and placed him in care for three years.

His time in care was worse than mine and he told me he was abused daily. He tried many times to run away from the abuse, but he was always found and returned to his abusers, and he reported the abuse to social workers, but he was not believed, or they did not care, and this always weighed heavily on him.

30 A.
31

33 Q. You34 A. Yes.

Q.

Jason aged out of care, partnered, and they had five children together. His partner had four children to previous partners, so Jason became a father to nine in total. They lived in a small three-bedroom where in Rotorua, and I would go over there at least once or twice a week to make sure that they were okay and also to take my niece home with me. So, we had her a lot from a baby, and we ended up having her permanently when my brother left.

He was arrested for physically abusing the eldest daughter, and this is something he and I had always made a pact growing up that we would never hit our children, that we would never allow them to live in a space that we had suffered. And that was a pact that I held very, very dear. However, for my brother that wasn't the case, and he was physically abusive to his partner and his children.

He was so-- he was arrested and then he was he- was out on bail, and he was actually on bail here in Te Awamutu, and due to some texts, that had gone backwards and forwards, he left that address and on 14 April 2004 while on bail he returned to the family home with a loaded rifle intent on shooting his partner. He pointed it directly at her, but when he fired it, it was jammed, thank goodness. There was someone else there as well that helped to dislodge the gun from his arms and he took off and the Police were called-.

He disappeared, nobody saw him until 21 April when he appeared out of nowhere and threatened his partner's sister, and that was the last sighting ever made of him. With the help of the Police, we searched high and low for him for the next six years without success.

In 2010 at a Coroner's hearing Jason was officially declared deceased and I was the only family member present, as well as my husband. Both of my parents did not attend and the whole process was absolutely devastating. Walking out of that court just made it feel that again, my brother had always felt that he had never been loved especially by our mother and this just walking out and having to go through this process by myself just solidified that view for me.

However, the Coroner's hearing was, I felt was as good as you could experience, I guess. The judge was lovely, and everyone was very supportive in that space with us. How did it feel not having your parents there?

- I just I- was devastated, not for myself, but for my brother, you know, he'd -never we- had never experienced anything but negativity from our parents. -This was the last thing that they could have done for him and for them not to even do that, I was devastated for him.
- **Q.** You say that Jason went on to have five biological children.

Q.	Can you s	speak about	where they	are now?
----	-----------	-------------	------------	----------

A. All of his children have suffered tremendously, in and out of State care themselves. The eldest one we raised. She is probably the only one that's fared quite well because she's with us, we've raised her, she's had two children herself and lives in Hamilton.

The next child is a boy and up until just recently he was doing very, very well, but however-, he's lost his job and become homeless. The next one -is she- -is just- turned 21 yesterday. She is an emergency housing with her two children and has been there for quite some time-.

The next one, he is 18 I think now. He has been in and out of Youth Justice, and the hardest part is knowing that that's not going to stop due to his behaviours. He has ADHD and other issues, sits just outside of the autistic spectrum. However, there's he- was on medication when he lived with us, but when he was returned to his mother, he -didn't he- stopped taking it and so I worry about him all the time-.

The youngest one, she had a child at 13. Had that child I believe for the first six months and the child was removed, went on to have another child at 15. This is all while in the care of the State, I must add. And that child was removed from birth. She lives in Auckland with her boyfriend and sees her children very sporadically. But again, no support that I can see, no positive support in order to make any changes for her.

- Q. So, if I heard you correctly, Oranga Tamariki are involved with Jason's two youngest children?
- A. Yes, they're involved with all, apart from the eldest one because we had that one, but they were involved in some way with all of them. The two boys remained with us for some years, whereas the two girls were returned back to into- the foster care system due to it becoming quite hard on my husband and myself and, in turn, our marriage was starting to feel the pressure-. So, I had to make some life choices there.

The foster home that they were in was actually a really good foster home. However, they ran away, they told lies and I can say that they told lies because they actually told me that they were lies, so that they could get back to their mother, and they were given back to their mother and from there everything else spiralled."

**COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Kia ora koutou, kua tae mātou ki te mutunga o tēnei wāhanga, (thank you, we have reached the end of this part), we'll now take a 15minute break. Kei te pai, counsel? (Is that okay, counsel)? We'll be back in 15 minutes.

## Adjournment from 3.18 pm to 3.36 pm

**COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā koutou katoa and welcome back to this afternoon's evidence.

1		Ms Emery, tēnā koe e te whaea, I just want to check to make sure you can hear us,
2		okay?
3	A.	Yes, I can, thank you.
4	Q.	Kapai, awesome, okay, we'll go back to the recording then.
5		(Video played).
6	QUE	STIONING BY MS NORTON CONTINUED: "From here I want to move on to the
7		impacts on you because of your time in care.
8	A.	Mmmhmm.
9	Q.	And I want to talk in a general sense, but if we can start, we've heard quite a lot of evidence
10		today about you and Jason disclosing the abuse to various social workers and we've heard
11		your evidence that they ignored it, and nothing was done. Has that impacted on you, and
12		obviously Jason's not here, did that impact on Jason?
13	A.	Oh, most definitely. I mean, yes, my brother and I took different paths in life, but every
14		part of my life is centred around the intergenerational trauma and working so hard to ensure
15		that my whānau don't suffer. However, when I talk about my son, that's the ultimate,
16		absolute ultimate consequence and while I'm not placing any blame on MSD, where I do
17		think accountability lies is the environments in which we are placed in. Because that, in
18		effect, affects our future generations.
19		With my brother, he yearned for the love of his mother, he yearned for him to be
20		heard. He had every all- the best intentions as his children were growing up. However,
21		poverty, no support and just the negativity led him to do what he did, and regardless of the
22		support that I gave him, you know, and that's something that always sits with me is that
23		I couldn't save him, just as much as I couldn't save my son. But it all centres around our
24		time in care. You can put an arrow to that centre and in the way in which we think and the
25		way in which we feel
26		My brother and I both, we struggled to trust people. We struggled to believe that
27		people were going to do what they say. That's something that I still struggle with today, is
28		being able to trust and to know that a process is going to be followed.
29		I'm very mindful and very articulate in the way now in which I follow process
30		to and- when I practise, because anything that I do say, I make sure that I do, because
31		I never want anybody that I'm working with to think that I haven't heard them and that
32		I haven't followed through on what I said I would do
33		And so, unfortunately, for my brother he never got the chance to really shine, he

never had the chance to watch his children grow up, and as his sister, I couldn't protect him

from that, and no matter what I tried to do, it still I- still couldn't save him. -And so, for years I have held a lot of guilt around that, that I could have done more.

Of course, losing my son has been the absolute catalyst and I go through all of those emotions, but that tenfold intensifies when it's your child.

But my path now is just trying to make sure my mokos aren't going to go they're- never going to feel any of what we've been through, that they're never going to have that experience and that's something that I'm extremely passionate about. And those mokos- include my brother's children as much as I can.

- **Q.** At paragraph 4.6 you talk about your time in Dey Street.
- 10 A. Mmmhmm.

- You talk about being in the secure unit, you talk about being placed in the position of being lookout/distractor. What are the impacts of that on you? If we go back there, you were 12, 13 years old, and you went through some pretty tough times. Can you help us understand what the impact of your time in that facility has had on you today?
  - A. I have a zero tolerance for bullying for one, and that includes my children and my grandchildren being a part of that space. I'm probably quite outspoken when it comes to abuse. I'm outspoken when it comes to my my mokos have, they've come to me and said, "Nan, I saw someone getting beaten up at school today." And my first reaction is, "What did you do? Did you go and say something?" And they said, "No" which would just revert me straight back to that day-.

So, it's having those conversations with them about being able and feeling safe enough to have those sorts of conversations. My grandson has now come to me and said that he's seen something happening, he's actually stepped in and diffused the situation which I thought was amazing, although I did say to him you need to go to an adult to do that. But it just shows that he is listening, and he is seeing the bigger picture, that when others aren't as fortunate or don't have what you have, that that's okay. But don't let abuse, if you see abuse, just say something.

- Q. Now I'm going to get you to talk about the impact of the decision made by the social worker to place you with your uncle.
- 30 A. Mmmhmm.
- **Q.** Can you talk to us about that?
- A. In hindsight it's one of the worst decisions that they could have made. I mean, they knew what went on in that house, they knew who my uncle was, they knew who everyone else

was in the house. So, it really does bewilder me that any social worker would think that it's a positive thing to place me there.

You know, things like they didn't offer us housing, they knew where I was sleeping, they knew everything, because they took me there. They showed me around the house, that was the last time I saw them. So yeah, there is no support in terms of a whānau unit, instead I was living with a gang. And any social worker today, there would just be no, absolutely no way that that would even be looked upon as an option.

Well, I would like to think so in this day and age.

- Q. At paragraph 10.6 you say: "I believe that my son's death is a direct result of my time in State care." Can you share your views around this?
- A. I believe that if I wasn't placed with my uncle, I would never have gotten into a relationship with a fellow gang member, hence I would not have had a child to a gang member, and then my son be raised in that environment. It is a direct result of my time in State care, and the environments that I was placed in.
- Tash, I'd like to move on to redress now. It's at paragraph 8 of your statement. These paragraphs deal with your own experiences with the historical claims process, and your own reflections, which I will ask you to share with us now. The first question I have is:

  How did you find out about the historical claims process and what are your reflections around this?
- A. I found out about the historical claims process from a person I was studying with when I was completing my degree, and I also saw a post or an advert, I think, on Facebook.

In hindsight, I don't believe I should have ever found out about this process that way, that more care, more research should have been undertaken to find out who those were, who those were that were in State care during that time, and just asking if they would like to share their story in terms of the redress.

- Q. At paragraph 8.2 to 8.4 you deal with what I consider to be cultural appropriateness, the need to be believed, sensitivities to claimants and making it an easier process. What are your reflections around all of these factors?
- A. So, if I look back into my first interview, that occurred by two very mature Pākehā women.
  While I did feel at ease during the interview, I did feel that they already had a preconceived
  notion of who I was and what I was going to say. I found out a week later, after a phone
  call with one of these women, that they hadn't pushed "record" during the interview
  process. However, she said to me, "That's okay, I got everything down and I think my
  notes will be suffice."

I did say about I- did query the validity and accuracy of my interview if it wasn't recorded, and I even offered to come back and do it again and they said no that they had all the information that they required-.

I had to follow up and then I was made to feel in the responses like I was being a hōhā (annoying). About a year or two after that interview I emailed MSD and just asked them for an update and was told you've already been told this can take up to three years and we'll be in contact with you when we know the next step.

So that led me to believe that they didn't know what that next step was, because they certainly hadn't told me what that would look like. I assumed that my the- reason why- it was going to take so long was because they were going to actually go out and investigate my claims, talk to people, and find out if my claims were valid at all. However, I found that that didn't happen.

The second interview was with a male and a female, both being Māori. They contacted me over the phone, and this was two weeks after I had lost my son. I explained to them that I wasn't in a good space, I had just lost my child, could we look at rescheduling. I was told no, they didn't know when they would be back in Hamilton, so it was really in my best interests to attend. So, I did and reiterated again just how difficult it was for me to be there, and I didn't know at the time that they actually had an offer until I got to the interview.

When they showed me the offer, they also talked about how they had looked at my claims and then had looked at my file and come up with that's- how the redress amount was selected, for want of another word. There was a list on the letter that they gave me around the specific statements that I had made and according to my file this is what it said-.

So, it actually said it would not be part of the redress amount because it couldn't be substantiated, certain parts, and there were other parts they couldn't prove to substantiate so they had to make it part of the redress amount, which I found quite - I was very irritated around that. Mainly because, A, it took up to three years for it to happen, and B, they had just gone to my file, they hadn't gone anywhere else, they hadn't spoken to anybody. -They had just taken whatever was written in that file.

They offered me an amount of \$10,000, and like I had said throughout this entire process, that this wasn't about money, it was about being a part of the change. But - and- if I hadn't had been in the space that I was in, I probably would have declined the money, and I said to them that I wanted that written, whatever notes they were writing, that I wanted that written, that the only reason that I was accepting it was that I knew there were more

1 costs to come in terms of losing my child, which was a headstone and everything else.
2 That's the only reason that I signed that form and accepted the payment. Because I don't

believe any amount of money is going to take away the trauma that we've suffered. I think promoting change and actually showing that change in our systems means more to me than

any money. And that's why I was doing it. But I wanted to be very clear about why I was

6 accepting that payment.

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

So, I did that, I received that money within five days I think, it was very quick, and also received a letter acknowledging my time in State care and a formal letter of apology. However, I've got a friend that has one of those letters and it's exactly the same. So, it's a generic letter that's given to all.

So, it didn't mean that- does mean a lot to me, more than the money, because it's actually saying that they acknowledge what we went through. However, I think on the flip side of that, we know how generic it was, so as time has moved on, I think that letter doesn't- hold much mana for me.

- 15 **Q.** What for you would be a more meaningful apology?
- I think a more meaningful apology would be a face-to-face apology, somewhere in a space 16 A. where we feel safe, i.e., a marae, a space of our choosing where we actually come together. 17 That may not be other survivors it may be just yourself, but I would have loved to have 18 taken my whānau and be a part of that process. A little bit like restorative justice for want 19 20 of another way of explaining it, where everybody comes together and acknowledges faceto-face what's happened and apologises for what they've endured. I don't think it costs 21 anything, and I think it can really restore the mana and the relationships that people can 22 have with one another. 23
- 24 **Q.** Is it important to you who that person is that offers the apology?
- 25 A. Yes, and I don't think it should be a national person, I would prefer the regional person, 26 because that's in the rohe in which I lived and it's pertinent (in the region) as opposed to 27 others.
- Q. At paragraph 8.6 you talk about the timeframe for your claim, and you were told that it would be up to three years?
- 30 A. Yeah.
- Q. Do you think this was an appropriate timeframe and do you have any alternatives?
- A. Definitely not a good timeframe, especially bearing in mind that all that happened with my case was that they looked at a file and they didn't go externally and talk to anybody, they

took all of theirs based on what was written in my file. That should take no longer than six months and even that I think is, in a sense, could be too long.

I think that the survivors shouldn't have to go looking, they shouldn't be having to ask questions, that MSD should be forthcoming and saying, "Come with us, let us help you, let us support you through this space."

I know that there has been other support put in place for survivors where they can go to get support through the process, which I think is great, but I think the biggest thing is the amount of time that it took, but also in the way in which these interviews are conducted. I don't think I- mean; I was okay with those two females. However, there could be those that are severely traumatised that wouldn't be able to manage that-.

So, it's making sure they know who they are looking after and that they are looking after them. Because I didn't feel looked after through the process.

- Q. So, if we're looking forward, what would be an appropriate timeframe for which the State should process a claim?
- A. I think six months is appropriate given the fact that they're only looking at the files. I think if it's a the- claims are more extreme, then maybe a year, but that would be on the basis that they're- actually going out and having hui with people to gain more information. But if it's like they did in my case, which was just looking at the file, no more than six months.
- Q. How important is it for claimants to know what the claim process looks like, what inquiries will be made and how they can expect to be kept updated about their claim, how important is that?
  - A. I think that's extremely important, because if you've got to be part of the process and I think that's something that I wasn't. I wasn't part of the process, you're- just being told what you have to do; you've got to do to this interview and then hear nothing then you go to another one, and then they push a piece of paper at you. Whereas if you're part of the process, you're able to be open and honest, you can see what's happening and you feel supported and believed.

My second interview where they talked about what they had read in my file versus what I had stated, pretty much they were saying that I was lying because it either wasn't in the file or it was in the file, and they told me that where I talk about not seeing anybody after I was placed with my uncle was untrue, and he said that because he said there's a note on file that says that so and so came to see you on this date. And I said to that social worker, I know for a fact no one came to see me. So, whoever put that in there is incorrect.

- And he said, well, we've taken your redress amount and that's been taken into account. So, yeah, it wasn't increased based on that.
- That was my next question. So, what you're saying is, because something wasn't on the

  MSD record, you your-- compensation amount was calculated as less, because they chose
  to believe MSD recording as opposed to you yourself?
- 6 A. Yes, yes.
- 7 **Q.** That speaks to people claim making or processing the claims believing the survivor. So, can you give us some reflections on that?
- 9 A. Yeah, it's wrong, there has to be a process around that. I mean, like, I wasn't going to sit
  10 there and say that the social worker was lying. But that social worker was lying because
  11 that social worker never came. What did I have to gain by saying that? You know? But
  12 they need to be able to take into consideration everything that's been said regardless of
  13 what's sitting in that file.

I mean, history has already spoken about this sort of practice where things haven't happened but get the - the file says that it does and there's more and more survivors that have said the same. So why wasn't that taken into consideration? The fact that it was written to say this is -we're- not going to make this part of -your the- redress amount, that's- what really affected me, the fact that they would write something like that on a piece of paper.

- Q. At paragraph 9.2 you say: "I feel very passionate about survivors being compensated for what they endured in State care."
- 22 A. Yeah.

14

15

16

17

18

- 23 **Q.** This may be a difficult question for you, but can you comment on how you think compensation should be calculated?
- I think they should it- should be calculated around the survivor, A the trauma, but B the 25 A. 26 intergenerational trauma as well. So how has this affected not only them but their families-. For example, you know, I have friends that are survivors, and they live in 27 absolute poverty, absolute poverty, their children are now living in absolute poverty. No 28 support, you know, if they were offered more adequate housing, a vehicle, something like 29 that, not just in terms of money. Money is quite easily you- give money to a person that's 30 living in poverty, what are they going to do with it? -You give money to a survivor that 31 suffers from gambling or alcohol issues or drug issues, what do you think's going to happen 32 to it? How is that going to really benefit them in the long run and their children and their 33 34 future mokopuna, you know?

1		I think they should be looking at the whole environment in which the survivor lives
2		and looking at the supports and what they can do to make their lives a bit better, because at
3		the end of the day it's their time in State care that got them to this place, and until that's
4		acknowledged, we're not going to see change.
5	Q.	In terms of your own experience with Oranga Tamariki, do you think they're getting it right
6		now?
7	A.	I think they're starting to; I think with the new graduates that we are creating, moving
8		forward into our space, into the social work sector, there's a lot of more positive outcomes
9		in terms of working with our families. I can say that because I work alongside other social
10		workers, I'm actually part of graduating new social work practitioners, and I have a lot of
11		friends who are working in Oranga Tamariki now, and they've all said that a lot of changes,
12		positive change is starting to happen within the organisation.
13		The practice itself, especially in terms of our biculturalism is really starting to
14		become instilled in our social workers and those that weren't haven't- been taught in a
15		bicultural way have now been offered training to be able to learn a little bit more in terms
16		of biculturalism. I think it's working. I do think it's- working.
17	Q.	PhD
18	A.	Yeah.
19	Q.	and I know you haven't started writing it yet?
20	A.	Yeah.
21	Q.	And that's why I flagged it was a big question.
22	A.	Mmm.
23	Q.	So, your PhD centres around the intergenerational trauma suffered by survivors of State
24		care and their own whanau. Do you have some insights that you're wanting to share with
25		us now around what intergenerational trauma looks like?
26	A.	Okay. So, I am yes-, I am completing a PhD around intergenerational trauma, the ongoing
27		result of State careAnd so, my PhD is centred around survivors, but also
28		autoethnography which includes mine and my brother's stories and ultimately talks about
29		my son as well.
30		My son's story will be told in order to show that the ongoing effects of State care
31		travel into the lives of not only the survivor but the survivor's future generation and beyond.

So, the thesis will be around interviewing five other survivors and looking at the

mokopuna, could even be their great mokopuna now, and what life has been like for them.

intergenerational trauma that not only they have suffered but their children, their

32

33

How have they chosen to navigate through that trauma and how what- does that look like for them today-.

1 2

Q.

A.

It's an extremely emotional journey for everyone involved but I find that writing is healing, it helps me to heal as I write, and I want to be able to share the survivors' stories in a way in which upholds their mana and shows that while they have suffered such trauma they're still here and they're still fighting for change and they're still fighting to break that intergenerational trauma in some cases.

I'm also hoping that some of the interviewees that I've already identified that I can help with the redress, but also to help put really good supports in place for them. Because some have had none, absolutely none.

- **Q.** And I know you're early in the piece with your PhD, but what kinds of supports have you identified that would be helpful for survivors?
- A. One of them is one- of them is raising their grandchildren and didn't know anything about the financial side of things and has had their grandchildren for three years, and they just -they've- tried to contact support places but nothing's happened. I've- actually already worked with them to get a benefit for these kids. But due to the lack of their education, they didn't know who to go, who to see and everywhere that they did go everything was turned down.

So, any support based on their environment now and any support that they need, which I do outside of my mahi.

- You touched earlier on Jason's children and the trauma, the ongoing trauma in terms of their own lives. In terms of redress, is support for those tamariki something that should be given consideration by those who determine what redress should look like for survivors?
- Yes, I believe all of his children should have some sort of involvement even now. Even though some of them are adults, they still need a lot of support and that clearly shows with the uplift of their children, with Oranga Tamariki being involved. However, I do believe that they've retraumatised these children. You take my brother's journey, then their journey, and the social workers looking after them have not looked after -them well-, I don't believe they've- looked after them in an adequate space, and an example of that is my 13-yearold niece having a child at -13 sorry-, she's 17 now, having a child at 13 and then having another one at 15, all in the care of the State-.

The social worker, when I rang to query what was happening this- is prior to the second child being -born said-, "I don't know where she is, I think the she's- in Auckland but she rings me." That's all I got.

I felt sometimes I'd ring Oranga Tamariki and say these kids need help and I was seen as a hōhā (as a nuisance) and they didn't want to take my calls after a while, because I was the one that was always ringing, following up saying, "What's happening?" And that's pretty much where we're at now.

w

A.

where they really didn't have a chance to have a normal life. I can only hope that they will start making better choices and seeing that life can get better and can get easier.

It's just really sad that they've had to have a life and be raised in an environment

**Q.** How do you think Jason's children have been impacted by his disappearance?

Q.

25 A.

Ii kids for i

I think heavily, heavily impacted the because they haven't had a role model in their lives. I don't want to sit here and discredit their mother, but she has struggled as well, she had nine children and no support, then when he left, she still had all these children and she couldn't cope, and no matter what I tried to do, there was still no support and then the children ended up being uplifted. They were told that they would never return to their mother, and I heard two social workers say that, and I also heard the lawyer for child say that, that they would never return to their mother. But the fact remains that they were returned to their mother, and not long after that, we ended up with a 13yearold pregnant girl. They were still under the care of Oranga Tamariki during this time.

And they yeah-, so the girls all went on to have children. The youngest boy in and out of Youth Justice, and I don't see any end in sight unfortunately. I don't- see any end in sight for them.

You had to make the difficult decision in terms of Jason's children, in terms of who you could help and who you couldn't. If under the redress system that financial support and other support was made available to you, would your decision have been different in terms of those of Jason's children that you did not take in?

I can't really answer that, I think it would depend on the whole circumstance at the time. But for us as a whānau we had our mokos in and out as well and then we had them. It became the- pressure on my marriage was the biggest focus for us at the time. -Because we had two to begin with and then we ended we- had the other three, so we did keep one of them, so we ended up with three of them and it was the two girls. And it was a very hard decision to make, and it wasn't financial at all. -It was just becoming there- was behaviours and I didn't feel we were being supported with those behaviours-.

It took three months before we could even have a reprieve, where they picked up the kids for the weekend, and had respite. Even then they turned up, I think it was like 7

o'clock that night and then they were returned to us the next day after we'd been told it was going to be for the weekend. There was a lot of yeah-, there wasn't a lot of support-.

I think in- saying that I think the social worker at the time thought because I was in the social work space that I would be able to manage it and that I wouldn't need as much support as the next person. And while she never actually said that,- I do believe she was referring to that a number of times. But I did need support, and I did need help.

The behaviour issues that we had as well as it- wasn't- financial by any means, but it was just running a whole household of five children plus our mokopuna coming in and out, it became too much. So, we had to make as- soon as my husband said to me that this was affecting our marriage, that's when I had to really think about it, because I hadn't thought really about him a lot in the process. He had just gone, "Okay, if that's what you want, we'll do it." And I hadn't- taken into consideration how he actually felt about it. So that was a catalyst for me to make some changes.

**Q.** At this point we're heading into closing comments. So, I've spoken about some pretty big kaupapa in this reflections section. Is there anything else that you feel you should have said?

I can recap. We've talked about that ora(?) question, we've talked about your PhD, we talked about it's a wish, if you like, if the redress system was able to factor in supports and financial compensation for those, you know, generational issues for children who have been impacted by that.

When you think about those three questions, is there anything that you want to finish up on?

- A. Not really, to be honest, that sort of encompassed everything.
- Q. So, we are still under the heading of redress. In terms of redress, are you familiar with the term "by Māori for Māori"?
- 26 A. Yes.

- 27 Q. Can you share with us your comments in terms of that particular whakaaro?
- A. I believe Māori for Māori within the redress process should be taken into consideration.

  Māori for Māori in terms of the environment in which you're in when holding these hui and having these conversations, predominantly Māori working with Māori through the redress process, and ensuring that all facets of tikanga and kawa (protocols) are adhered to throughout. Kapai.
- **Q.** At this point, Tash, I'm going to ask you if you have any closing comments to make.

A. Just in closing I just want to say I- want to acknowledge those that are in my life that have helped me to get where I am today. I also want to acknowledge my brother and my son-.

I've always believed that the environments that we were raised in as being we- are a product of those environments. However, my life has changed through the betterment of my husband, my family, and my husband's family who have guided me and allowed me to navigate in the way I needed to navigate to make positive changes for us. Unfortunately, that wasn't the case for my brother or my child. I can only hope that those who watch this take some guidance or some of my words on board in terms of we can make that change, but we need to be able to seek and not be afraid to ask for the support to get that change. Not be afraid to talk to people and not be afraid to be open and honest about what's- happened to us.

I also believe in terms of social work practice that it needs to be more inclusive and collective in terms of working with not only the children, but with the whānau, and creating that whānau atmosphere, instilling ahurutanga into the space so that we feel safe, that they feel connected, that they feel that they can have that relationship with the social worker that is there to look after them. I hope that with these new changes that are coming about within the sector that ahurutanga (a care), taukumekume, manaakitanga, tino rangatiratanga will start being instilled into all facets of their practice in order to build great lives.

A lot of the time it's not just the child that should be centred around the issue it's the whānau which encases that child, and providing that support as little as, like I've said numerous occasions, if we had been offered bigger housing, I do believe and I believe with all my heart that my life would have been drastically different, my brother's life would be drastically different and that of my child's.

So, I thank you for allowing me to be a part of this space and, I don't know what else to say. Kia ora."

MR CLAASEN: Tēnā koe e te Tiamana, otirā tēnā tātou. I te tuatahi e tika ana kia mihi atu ki a koe, e Miss Emery. Kua rongo i tō mamae me ngā kōrero i te ahiahi nei. Tēnei au ka mihi. Waiho mai ki ēnei kōrero ki a tātou hei hikina, hei kawe ake i runga i ngā marama, i runga i ngā tau e tū mai nei.

[English: Thank you Mr Chairman and to all of us. Firstly, to acknowledge Ms Emery. We've heard your pain this afternoon. Leave these words with us to lift and to make it easier for those in years to come.]

1		Ms Emery, and if I can just ask that we now show her screen, Ms Emery, thank you
2		for sharing your korero with us today and your whakaaro. Was there anyone else that you
3		wanted to acknowledge?
4	A.	Yes, there is. I just wanted to make mention of my grandparents who were my they- were
5		my heroes, and they were the ones that were there for us throughout this whole time
6		I'd also like to make mention to my husband who's also stood by me throughout all
7		of this and has been a part of my life for the past 27 years. And I'd also like to
8		acknowledge one of my closest friends Damila(?) who's walked beside me through this as
9		well and has been a part of my journey, especially in the support after losing my child.
10		Kia ora tātou.
11	Q.	Tēnā koe, Ms Emery. (Te reo Māori you are a survivor. The challenge has been laid for us
12		to uplift).
13		Mr Chairperson, I'll now pass it back over to you.
14	CON	MISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koe, Mr Claasen.
15		Tēnā koe, Ms Emery, kei te mihi atu ki a koe me o korero mai e takoho mai (I want
16		to acknowledge you and your narrative that you've shared with us) I want to thank you for
17		your evidence today. I'm sorry for your loss for your brother and for your son. I'm sorry
18		also to hear about your experience with the redress scheme. I'm excited, though, to hear
19		about the mahi that you're doing through your PhD, such critical work, focusing on the
20		generational impact of those in care and recognise how it's healing for you to be doing this
21		mahi.
22		I wonder, Ms Emery, would you be open to having some questions from my
23		colleagues, the Commissioners?
24	A.	Kapai, yes.
25	Q.	Tino pai, tēnā koe (very good). So, if I could pass to one of my colleagues, Sandra
26		Alofivae, can we start with you, Ms Alofivae. Kia ora.
27	CON	MISSIONER ALOFIVAE: Kia ora. Tēnā koe, Ms Emery. Talofa lava, Malo le soifua
28		maua, thank you very, very much for the generosity and the spirit in which you shared your
29		experiences. I tautoko (I support) the comments of Commissioner Erueti around your loss
30		and your contribution actually back to our nation through the work that you're doing.
31		I was very encouraged by your perspective around Oranga Tamariki and what you
32		currently see. I guess I've just got a question that I'd just like to put to you. Do you think

they're going far enough in terms of what you're actually seeing currently?

- 1 A. I think they are working towards it; I don't think they're there yet, but I think
- there's they're-- being active in the space in order to make positive change. I do believe it's
- a stepping stone.
- 4 Q. Okay. And is that in terms of both the policy and the practice that you're referring to?
- 5 A. More the practice.
- 6 Q. Okay, but fundamentally, there are assumptions that underlie the practice that would need
- 7 to be looked at quite carefully.
- 8 A. Definitely.
- 9 Q. Okay. And no doubt that's a space that you would be able to korero into quite strongly,
- maybe at another point in time for us?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 **Q.** Maybe at future wananga.
- 13 A. Yes, I'd be happy to.
- 14 **Q.** Thank you very, very much, malie, fa'afetai faasoa.
- 15 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā koe, Ms Alofivae. If I could turn to Paora Gibson, Paul
- Gibson, for any questions.
- 17 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Kia ora, whaea. No pātai from me but really looking forward to
- hearing more of your work as it progresses and ultimately as you finish it, finish your PhD,
- 19 kia ora.
- 20 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā koe, Paora. If I could pass to Commissioner Steenson.
- 21 **COMMISSIONER STEENSON:** Tēnā koe, Natasha. I just wanted to -- as you can see, as a
- precautionary measure I've been sent home out of the wharenui, but I wanted to make sure
- 23 that I got a chance to acknowledge that we have met and know each other from our mahi,
- and yeah, so also I've had the pleasure of meeting you before, but tēnei te mihi ki a koe (I
- really want to acknowledge you) for your contribution to this big kaupapa and all of the
- study that you're doing that will add to that body of matauranga, but yeah, thank you so
- 27 much.
- 28 A. Kia ora.
- 29 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā koe, Ms Emery. I wondered if I could ask about your
- thoughts about reflecting on what you see as social work failures from your lived
- 31 experience. What do you see as the major challenge for the young social worker
- practitioners that are graduating from your programme?
- A. I think probably one of the biggest challenges is around lived experience, lived experience
- social-- workers who have lived experience can empathise alongside the kaupapa that

	they're looking after, whereas those that haven't been in the space can sometimes take a
2	little bit longer to understand the whānau that they're supporting and in order to put the
3	right supports in place. That's not to say that they won't understand that space, but I do
1	think that those with the lived experience are great, make great social workers.

- Q. Kapai. That makes perfect sense. And you spoke also about how graduates today have are-starting now with more of a bicultural framework. -Are you able to elaborate a bit more about what that means and how it differs from, you know, what underpins social work practice in the past?
  - A. Yeah, so the organisation that I work for, we teach the Bachelor of Bicultural Social Work and what makes us unique is our takepu(?) (our values) which we (inaudible) throughout our social work programme. And those takepu(?) include ahurutanga, kaitiakitanga, manaakitanga, (care, guardianship) and all of those there- is more, but they can all be aligned in our frameworks and in our practice-.

But for our degree it's instilled from day one and it's embedded in everything that we do, so it becomes more of a lifestyle about who we are, not just as social workers but who we are as people and it's how to create those genuine relationships to walk alongside our whānau, not in front of them.

Q. Āe, you talked a lot in your evidence about ensuring that whānau are involved and that social workers are more fully engaged in the whānau space and supporting them and walking alongside them, kei te tika, (yes, you're correct).

Nga mihi mahana ki a koe whaea (thank you very much). I don't have any questions, I want to take this opportunity to pass on to my colleague Commissioner Shaw to thank you on behalf of the Inquiry.

**COMMISSIONER SHAW:** Tēnā koe ano, Ms Emery. My privilege to thank you today on behalf of us all. And on behalf of all of those survivors who you have worked with and who you are working with currently and I include in that member, of course, of your own whānau.

I want to acknowledge Jason and I want to acknowledge James and they're such a potent part of your life, and your you- live their lives now and you're doing good through their memory and it's important that we say that-.

I also want to acknowledge your grandparents. What a tragedy that they were not able to hold you close when all they were trying to do was to love you. So, I'm sorry that I've upset you by referring to that, but I think it's really important to make sure that we do acknowledge that properly.

3 4

5

6 7

8

9 10

11

12 13

14 15

16 17

18 19

20 21

22 23

24 25

26

A.

27

Q.

28 29

31

32

33

34

**COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** E mihi ana ki a koe, whaea, mō to korero i tēnei rā. 30

Thank you.

[English: I want to thank you for what you've shared today.] I think we're going to turn now for a waiata in support of your korero today.

Tēnei te mihi mahana ki a koe mō to whanau.

(Waiata: Ko te aroha ano he wai. E pupū ake ana. He awa e māpuna mai ana i roto i

[English: I want to really acknowledge you and your family.]

te whatu-manawa. Ko tōna mātāpuna he hōhonu ā inā ia ka rere anō. He tai timu, he tai pari, he tai ope, he tai roa, he tai nui.

I'm not going to make it worse for you now. I just want to note that we know that social workers that you - who were entrusted with your care didn't treat you as a family, they treated you, everybody as individuals, I thought that was a very powerful statement, and so you've -closed - closing- that loop by the statement you've just made, that social workers should walk alongside whānau not in front of them, and that's a very important message which I want you to know we have heard.

And finally, after all the failures of social work and process and the rejection of all of the family needs that you've so obviously had, then we come to the redress and again, it is quite obvious you were failed by the process, and again, simple recognition of your mana, of your whānau in that process could have made all the difference, and it didn't.

So, you've been doubly hurt by that process, and we acknowledge that, and I want you to know that we have heard that too.

And like Paul Gibson said, we're looking forward very much to seeing the fruits now of your labours. The work that you're doing is incredibly important, it's right on the work that we are looking at ourselves. We're acutely aware and have learned so much over the last two weeks about the intergenerational impacts. It's easy to say it, but until we unpick it, learn it, know it, feel it, and recognise it, we can't even start to heal it. So, your work in that is so valuable, and so anticipated. So, I hope it's not going to take you as long as it took MSD to bear fruit on that, because we need that, we need that work, and we need it quickly.

So, I'm going to let you go now and just again, it's been a privilege to hear you, it's been valuable, and you may find we knock upon your door again, if we need some more information, and I hope if we do, you'll be able to assist us further.

So go and take a break, look after yourself and recover after this very exhausting afternoon.

1	(Waiata love is like water, effervescent, streaming up from the bed of emotions.
2	Sourced deep within, effervescent, streaming up from the bed of emotions, sourced deep
3	within, manifesting as a calming tide, as a river of strength, a conquering wave, an enduring
4	flow, a spectacular phenomenon, spectacular phenomenon. Again, a spectacular
5	phenomenon).
6	MS SPELMAN: Tēnā ano e te Heamana, otira ki ngā kaikōrero o te rā, i ngā kakano rangatira e
7	mihi ana ki a kōrua i o whanau hoki.
8	[English: Again, to the Chairman and to all those speakers today, I want to acknowledge
9	you both and your families.] Mr Chair, that brings us to the end of the day. Tomorrow we'll
10	have our first witness at 10 o'clock, but starting, as always, with karakia at 9.45.
11	COMMISSIONER ERUETI: Tēnā koe, Ms Spelman. Ka nui te mihi ki a koe, ki a koutou
12	(thank you, Ms Spelman). We're looking forward to resuming our session āpōpō at 9.45
13	am. If I could ask Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei to close our day today with a karakia and waiata,
14	tēnā koe te rangatira.
15	KAUMĀTUA TAIAHA: Tēnā koe e te whare. Ka irihia te kete kōrero ki te tāwharau whare. Nā
16	reira. Ko ngā tūpuna o tēnei whare, kua rangona ki ngā kōrero katoa i tēnei rā kua
17	whārikihia. $\bar{A}$ , ka noho ērā kōrero ki reira ki te wāhi ngaro pupuri ai, tae noa ki te wā ka
18	kimihia te Kōmihana i ngā whakamārama, kia puta mai he hua ki roto i ngā pūrongo a muri
19	ake nei, a muri ake nei.
20	[English: I acknowledge the house, we want to lift the narratives that have been shared
21	today. The ancestors of this house have heard and grasps the stories shared today. They
22	will remain with the spiritual realm, till such time the Commission finds undetanding and a
23	future resolution.]
24	Nā reira, ki ngā kaikōrero katoa o te rā, ka mihi atu ki a koutou. Kia piki te ora, te kaha, te
25	māramatanga, te rangimārie me te aroha ki runga i a koutou ahakoa ngā taumahatanga, ngā
26	uauatanga, ngā roimata i heke, ā, kua tū kaha ai koutou ki te kōrero i ngā kōrero. Kia
27	mōhio, kia mārama i ō koutou mamae, ngā whakawhiu o te wā kua pāngia ki runga i a
28	koutou. Nā reira, kia kaha rā. Tēnei ka mihi, tēnei ka tangi, ā, ka tākina ko te kawa.
29	[English: So to all those that have shared today, let health, unserstanding, peace and love
30	fall upon you. Despite the heavy stories, the tears shed, that they be heard and understood,
31	the times that they affected you, that you were affected. Be strong. I acknowledge and
32	thank you.]
33	(Karakia: Waerea, waerea, waerea ki te nehenehe nui a Tāne. Kia hikina ko te
34	tapu. Kia turuki whakataha ai, kia turuki whakataha ai. Waerea te kauwae runga, waerea te

1	kauwae raro. Waerea te mana, waerea te wehi, waere te mākutu, waerea ngā whakamataku
2	katoa. Ka pō, ka ao, ka awatea ki te ao nui, ki te ao roa, ki te ao, tihewa Mauri ora. Ko tēnei
3	te mauri ka whakapiki, ko tēnei te mauri ka whakakake. Ka whakakake ki runga i te
4	Kōmihana e tau nei. Ka whakakake ki runga i ngā rōpū purapura ora e tangi nei. Ka
5	whakakake ki runga i ngā mātāwaka e tautoko nei. Ka whakakake ki runga Te Puru o
6	Tāmaki Ngāti Whātua e noho. Whiti, whiti, Pokopoko whiti te rā. Te aute tē taea te
7	whāwhea. Whiti ki te wheiao, whiti ki te ao mārama, whano, whano, haramai te toki, haumi
8	e, hui e, tāiki e. He wai.
9	(A ritual chant to clear the space and bring peace).
10	(Waiata: Ngā whakamoemiti, whakawhetai e Ihu e. Mō ōu manaakitanga ki te iwi e
11	tau nei. Ko koe te piringa, ka puta ki te oranga. E te Ariki, Paimārire).
12	[English: The grace of God, for your protection on to the people, you are the one
13	that will bring us together and show us a better life. Lord, everlasting peace. Lord,
14	everlasting peace.]
15	Tērā kōrero i waihotia mai e rātou ngā mātua, ngā tūpuna. Āpiti hono, tātai hono,
16	rātou ngā purapura whetū ki te rangi ki a rātou. Āpiti hono, tātai hono, tātou ngā
17	waihotanga mai o ngā mātua tūpuna e pae nei i tēnei rā. Kei aku mana nui, kei aku tapu nei,
18	tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, tēnā rā tātou katoa.
19	[English: Going back to that saying of our ancestors, those of the past, those
20	survivors to them, those of us left behind by our ancestors all gathered, thank you.]
21	Hearing adjourned at 4.39 pm to Thursday, 17 March 2022 at 9.45 am
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	