

**ABUSE IN CARE ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY
LAKE ALICE CHILD AND ADOLESCENT UNIT INQUIRY HEARING**

Under The Inquiries Act 2013

In the matter of The Royal Commission of Inquiry into Historical Abuse in State Care and in the Care of Faith-based Institutions

Royal Commission: Judge Coral Shaw (Chair)
Ali'imuamua Sandra Alofivae
Mr Paul Gibson

Counsel: Mr Simon Mount QC, Ms Kerryn Beaton, Mr Andrew Molloy,
Ms Ruth Thomas, Ms Finlayson-Davis, for the Royal
Commission
Ms Karen Feint QC, Ms Julia White and Ms Jane Maltby
for the Crown
Mrs Frances Joychild QC, Ms Alana Thomas and Tracey Hu
for the Survivors
Ms Moira Green for the Citizens Commission on Human
Rights
Ms Susan Hughes QC for Mr Malcolm Burgess and Mr
Lawrence Reid
Mr Michael Heron QC for Dr Janice Wilson
Ms Frances Everard for the New Zealand Human Rights
Commission
Mr Hayden Rattray for Mr Selwyn Leeks
Mr Eric Forster for Victor Soeterik
Mr Lester Cordwell for Mr Brian Stabb and Ms Gloria Barr
Mr Scott Brickell for Denis Hesseltine
Ms Anita Miller for the Medical Council

Venue: Level 2
Abuse in Care Royal Commission of Inquiry
414 Khyber Pass Road
AUCKLAND

Date: 23 June 2021

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

INDEX

| | |
|---|-----|
| MR AA | |
| Questioning by Ms Joychild | 605 |
| Questioning by Commissioners | 614 |
| | |
| CHARLES MAURICE SYMES | |
| Questioning by Ms T Thomas | 618 |
| Questioning by Commissioners | 626 |
| | |
| ALEyna MARY HALL, DAVID PETER DUNBAR | |
| Questioning by Ms Miller | 629 |
| Questioning by Mr Molloy | 637 |
| Questioning by Ms Joychild | 652 |
| | |
| VICTOR FREDERIK WILLEM SOETERIK | |
| Questioning by Mr Forster | 654 |
| Questioning by Mr Molloy | 674 |
| Questioning by Ms Joychild | 685 |
| Questioning by Commissioners | 689 |

1 statement, like we spoke, I'll pass it over to the Chair for your affirmation of your evidence.

2 **CHARLIE MAURICE SYMES**

3 **CHAIR:** Hello Chaz, I'm over here. Thank you very much for coming. Really appreciate, do you
4 mind if I call you Chaz?

5 A. Not at all.

6 Q. Good, so Alana will have explained I'm going to ask you to listen and agree to the
7 following. Do you solemnly, sincerely, and truly declare and affirm that the evidence you
8 give today will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Thank you very much. I'll leave it over to Alana now for you.

11 **QUESTIONING BY MS A THOMAS:** Tēnā koe ma'am. Just as a quick introduction before we
12 begin with Chaz's statement today, Mr Symes had two admissions into Lake Alice, one
13 when he was 15 years old for six weeks. He was then admitted for a second time when he
14 was 16 years old in 1974 to 1975 and spent almost a year in Lake Alice at that time.

15 So I just wanted to say thank you, Chaz, for coming today and acknowledging the
16 difficulty with presenting this statement. I also wanted to acknowledge the people that
17 couldn't be here with you today, but are symbolised or represented in the taonga that you
18 wear, so mihi ana ki a koe e hoa. So if I could take you straight to your statement and
19 begin at paragraph 1.

20 A. My name is Charles Maurice Symes. I live in Whanganui and was born in 1958. I am the
21 third to youngest out of 12 children. I am also a survivor of Lake Alice.

22 My early years at home weren't that good. My father wasn't home much. My
23 mother was very violent and I learned to be physical and to fight from an early age. My
24 mum, led mostly by Social Welfare, ended up putting me into State care from a very young
25 age because she could not control me.

26 I was sent to Hokio, Epuni and Kohitere and had a horrible time in all three
27 institutions. I was an angry boy and would act out quite a bit. I would run away a lot and
28 was sent to psychiatrists for them to try and help me. There are a number of psychiatrist
29 reports on me that mention stuff like I was depressed, I had self-destructive thoughts.- I'd
30 probably approve of that.- I was nervous, anxious, miserable and self---loathing. The most
31 recent before my admission to Lake Alice was on 10 April 1973.

32 Q. You don't have to read that part in the bracket.

33 A. I wasn't going to.

34 Q. Very good.

1 **CHAIR:** Chaz I take it you've read that report, haven't you?

2 A. I've sort of glanced through it. I agree that this is how I was feeling at the time. But this
3 was mostly because of the environment I was being brought up in. I even attempted to take
4 my own life. I just wanted to get away.

5 Leeks was one of the main doctors at the time down there, so I saw him when I
6 was at the boys' school. This was before I was admitted to Lake Alice. When I first met
7 him I thought he was a kind man, that's how he came across. But that changed very
8 quickly.

9 I had two stays in Lake Alice. The first was for six weeks and the second for
10 a year. I was committed on the first time on 4 October 1973. Doctor Pugmire, Lake Alice
11 admission and discharge, -oh,- I'll bypass that I think. I was diagnosed with hysterical
12 character disorder. Social Welfare put me there, not my parents. I was 15 years old. I was
13 put into villa 11. I was discharged on 18 November 1973.

14 Q. And I just pause you there quickly, Charlie, because you do want to make it clear, don't
15 you, that it was the State, not your parents that put you in Lake Alice?

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. Carry on to paragraph 6.

18 A. I was committed to Lake Alice for a second time on 1 October 1974 because of a knife
19 incident. Apparently I pulled a knife on my flatmates but to be honest I can't really
20 remember much about this.

21 I think it was ward 4 that I was put into first, I'm not too sure of the numbers. And
22 then later into ward 8, which is the security ward and a ward that they would put you in to
23 punish you. I think they transferred me over to ward 8 because I was too hard to deal with.
24 I was physically violent and would rebel against them and lash out a lot.

25 I was discharged for the second time on 30 October 1975 after spending almost
26 a year in there. I was not put in Lake Alice because of any mental issues and still think
27 I should not have been there. Leeks himself said in a report to the Magistrates Court in
28 1976 that I had a mental disorder.

29 Q. Just to clarify, that says no mental disorder eh Chaz that sentence?

30 A. Oh yeah, sorry. I missed already. When I obtained my medical and nursing notes, there
31 were no records of any of the drugs or ECT that I was given, doctor and nurses notes
32 mentioning violent outbursts, various dates between 74 and 75.

33 I received ECT for the first time after only being in Lake Alice for a few days.

34 **CHAIR:** Chaz, can I ask you a question? Over here.

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. Was it the first time after -- the first time you went to Lake Alice did you get ECT or was it
3 in the second time?

4 A. Second.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. Literally continuously.

7 Q. Absolutely, thank you for answering that.

8 A. Where was I?

9 **QUESTIONING BY MS A THOMAS CONTINUED:** Paragraph 9.

10 A. I received ECT for the first time after only being in Lake Alice for a few days.

11 I had ECT two to three times a week. It was usually without anaesthetic. ECT
12 was always used as a punishment. It was always Leeks who gave me ECT. There were
13 other nurses there too, big men who would pin me down to the table and pull belts over my
14 chest, waist and legs.

15 Whenever they tried to strap me down like this on the table, I would always lash
16 out and try to fight it. I would hear the ECT machine warming up, it would make this
17 humming sound that I can still remember today. Once the humming stopped, it meant the
18 machine was ready and the pain started.

19 I got shock treatment on my head, on my groin and on the soles of my feet, on my
20 neck and across my chest, anywhere Leeks wanted to put the shock pads really. It was
21 always in the most sensitive places. I received most of the shock treatments without an
22 anaesthetic. We all did.

23 The usual treatments would last between 5 to 10 minutes, but if Dr Leeks wanted
24 to be really mean, the ECT would last longer and longer. He really did enjoy it. The
25 longest session I had was about 45 minutes. I remember Leeks' face when he would turn
26 the knob, he smiled every time and his smile would get broader and broader the more pain
27 he caused.

28 When he finished shocking us, we were wheeled back into our wards. They would
29 unbuckle the straps that were holding us down and roll us off on to our beds. We were just
30 flicked off like we were rag dolls. It would take about five to six hours to come out of it.
31 This was whether we received anaesthetic or not because the ECT would knock you out
32 either way.

33 I also had ECT on my genitals. I still have the burn marks from it. I believe this is
34 the reason why I've never been able to have children. I had two wives and neither of them

1 could have children.

2 Lots of the kids got ECT. There was a day room filled with boys and girls where
3 we waited to find out if we were going to get ECT. Everyone was terrified. We never
4 received shock treatment together. Leeks liked to keep us separated. But you could hear
5 the screams of the kids when they were getting ECT.

6 Q. Take a moment, Chaz, it's fine. Ma'am, we might take a quick break.

7 **CHAIR:** Absolutely. If he would like someone else to read it that's fine. We'll just take a break.

8 **Adjournment from 11.01 am to 11.11 am**

9 **MS FEINT:** Madam Chair.

10 **CHAIR:** Yes Ms Feint.

11 **MS FEINT:** Just before we resume, I need to go to a funeral this afternoon so I need to seek leave
12 to withdraw just for the day and I'll be back in the morning.

13 **CHAIR:** Condolences for you and, of course, leave, thank you for the courtesy of asking.

14 **MS FEINT:** Thank you very much.

15 **QUESTIONING BY MS A THOMAS CONTINUED:** Kia ora Chaz. I just do want to point out
16 now, it's very important for you to read this statement which is why I haven't suggested that
17 myself or Rachel do that for you. But take your time, and if you do need any other breaks,
18 just let us know. So I think we were at paragraph 16 starting at "there was".

19 A. There was a group of us kids that would get together and talk about what would happen to
20 us when we went into the shock treatment room. The youngest one was only about 7 or 8.
21 The nurses would pull us apart if they saw us talking together.

22 We would try to protect ourselves by hiding each other when they would come to
23 get us for punishment. But it only made things worse. I remember them taking one of the
24 girls in our group and when she came back she had burns on her legs.

25 I was told that I received ECT to stop my violent outbursts, but every time I got
26 ECT it just made my anger worse. I got more and more violent. I hated it.

27 The worst time was when someone grabbed me from behind in the day room to
28 take me to ECT. I started fighting furiously not realising it was Dr Leeks. I broke his nose
29 in three places. Actually I enjoyed that.

30 I got a hammering from ECT after that. I got ECT for six days in a row and each
31 time it was harder and harder. I was then put in security for three weeks. People saw that
32 happen. When I got back to the ward after being in security all that time, the other kids
33 swamped me wanting to know what had happened. I was a bit of a hero for having broken
34 Dr Leeks' nose. Not saying I didn't enjoy it.

1 One time I had to be taken to Whanganui Hospital after receiving shock treatment
2 because I was having heart and breathing problems. I had to be put on a respirator and
3 stayed in hospital for about one and a half weeks.

4 In 1996 I had a heart valve replacement. I have a titanium valve and now I have to
5 take Warfarin regularly for the rest of my life. The surgeon told me that I should have --
6 I should never have had ECT because of -- because I had a hole in my heart. He said I was
7 lucky to be alive having been given ECT at that age.

8 I spent most of my time in ward 8 which was the security ward. I ended up in
9 there because I kept knocking over staff and being violent. I didn't mind being in isolation,
10 it gave me time to reflect.

11 It was much different in ward 8 than in ward 4 or any other wards that I saw. We
12 weren't given the chance to shower and wash frequently. One time I went without
13 showering for three months. Every time I went to have a shower they would turn me
14 around to go back or send me off to breakfast without showering.

15 I never went to school or received any type of schooling.

16 Q. Yes, I think that's supposed to be "or" eh Chaz, thank you for that.

17 A. When I was in Lake Alice. Me and a number of older boys were sexually abused in the
18 night by one of the staff. About three or four hours after we were sent to bed, they used to
19 come around to check on us, but instead of just checking on us, they would play with us.

20 I remember waking up one night and one of the male nurses was standing over me
21 with his hand, - and his hand was going down my waistline of my pants. I tried to yell but
22 he put his hand over my mouth to stop me making a sound. I don't remember his name, but
23 he was a Caucasian in my mid--20s,- oh, in his mid--20s and had a very soft-spoken-
24 voice. It was like he was trying to put me back to sleep when he spoke. He wore a Rolex
25 watch. I knew there was no point in complaining about this because no-one would believe
26 us. They would just call us liars, and they did. This went on for about a year.

27 Another time I heard that Dr Leeks' pet nurse was trying it on with one of the girls.
28 The nurse was 20 years older than the young woman. When we heard about this we waited
29 for him one night and attacked him. I was sent back to security then.

30 I escaped more than twice. One of the times was to see my father who was in
31 Whanganui Hospital. I asked Leeks if I could go and visit him but Leeks refused to let me,
32 so I jumped out the window. They found me about a week later and took me back to Lake
33 Alice. I wasn't allowed food or drink and was punished in the usual way, ECT.

34 One of the nurses called me the 'escape artist'. That is why I ended up in the

1 maximum security, which meant you were only allowed outside for less than an hour a day.
2 But that didn't really bother me. I got used to being inside. Lake Alice made sure of that, it
3 was like being in prison. I guess it got me ready for the time that I would go to prison as an
4 adult.

5 It made it hard to be on the outside, though. Lake Alice made me a loner. Having
6 people in my life just makes everything harder and I often push people away because
7 I prefer to be alone.

8 My medical notes say I received --

9 **Q.** You don't have to say all of those words there if you don't want to, but there's four drugs
10 that you note there.

11 **CHAIR:** Would you like to say them for him?

12 A. Be my guest.

13 **QUESTIONING BY MS A THOMAS CONTINUED:** Yeah no. You can start at "most of these
14 drugs".

15 A. Most of these drugs were used to knock us around and make us dummies.

16 Some of these were by injection, but most of them were standard tablets. If we
17 didn't take them, they forced them down us. We would be given drugs every day back
18 then, I was just too angry and the drugs heightened that. There were some that were
19 supposed to work as a relaxant, but they had the opposite effect on me. There were a few
20 of the older kids that were like me, and we would get more worked up, but most of them
21 would just blob out.

22 I remember getting a drug that I think was called --

23 **Q.** I can say this one, Paraldehyde.

24 A. Thank you. It made me wild and hyper and I would smell bad for about a week after.

25 Once again, one of the worst things for me about getting these drugs was the fact
26 that I had a heart problem and should not have been given these at all at my age. I'm lucky
27 to have survived Lake Alice and still be alive today.

28 I only remember Leeks' name, but when I was first introduced to him he was
29 called the doctor. I didn't remember names of the other staff members.

30 A lot of the staff were good but not the ones who would hold us down while
31 Dr Leeks strapped us on the bench for ECT. Sometimes there were eight staff holding you
32 down. We hated them, especially one nurse who was very violent with us as he dragged us
33 to the room.

34 There was a lot of physical violence between the boys. I was very fit and had a

1 mean, violent streak in me then. Going to Lake Alice just made me worse.

2 When I was in ward 8 I tried to hang out with the Māori boys more. We were the
3 majority [sic] in ward 8 and we had to try and find a way to survive. Coming together
4 when we could was one way. We still fought among each other but had - at least we were-
5 together.

6 I believe that Māori were treated a lot worse than other boys. We had way more
7 ECT than the others. We were the majority, -- minority I should say, but we still received
8 the most punishment.

9 The only way I got out of Lake Alice was because I knew that they did not like
10 gays. Me and another boy got into bed together and were mucking around with each other
11 so the staff could see. When one walked in and caught us, we were both kicked out and
12 just dumped outside the fence. We were around 17 at that time, we had to walk all the way
13 back to Whanganui.

14 Being gay was unheard of then and they didn't want me sticking around. That was
15 my way of getting out of there. My discharge note makes no mention of this. Dr Pugmire,
16 Lake Alice -- oh sorry. Later the Whanganui Magistrates Court asked for a report on me,
17 and Dr Leeks wrote that I had a mental disorder within the meaning of the Crimes Act.

18 Q. And just to reiterate, that sentence says no mental disorder.

19 A. Oh, sorry. I was 20 years old when I first tried to make a complaint about what happened
20 to me in Lake Alice. The Citizens Commission on Human Rights had contacted me to
21 make a statement. I wrote what happened to me. I prepared the statement myself from
22 what I could remember. I also used a diary that I kept while I was in Lake Alice to jog my
23 memory about the detail. I had to hide this diary from the staff so they wouldn't take it
24 away. I took it with me when I left but don't know where it is now. Actually I found the
25 diary a couple of weeks ago.

26 **CHAIR:** That's very interesting, good.

27 **QUESTIONING BY MS A THOMAS CONTINUED:** That might be something if you're happy
28 with, Chaz, that we could provide to the Commission, I think they would be interested in
29 seeing that diary.

30 A. Yeah, I'd have to dig it out again. It's in amongst one of the boxes I've got at home.

31 **CHAIR:** Someone can talk to you about it later and you can make a decision when you've had a
32 chance to think about it, but thank you.

33 **QUESTIONING BY MS A THOMAS CONTINUED:** Paragraph 45 "I took the statement".

34 A. I took the statement into the Whanganui Police Station and also sent a copy to -- of this in

1 the mail to the Ministry of Health, but they put it on the shelf and forgot it. After that
2 I turned off the memories of Lake Alice because there were too many bad memories. I just
3 wanted to block them out. I was very glad that chapter of my life was closed.

4 I received 42 grand in the Grant Cameron payout for pain and suffering. I don't
5 know if I was in the first or second group, but I know that I only received one payment.
6 That money was not enough.

7 A few months ago the Police came to visit me and asked me to go to the
8 Whanganui Police Station to give a statement about Lake Alice. I did, but I told them that
9 it had taken them 40 years to get their arses into gear and decide to take me seriously.

10 ECT has affected my short--term memory and I don't think it is as good as it could
11 have been. While I can remember my time in Lake Alice, I can't remember things such as
12 appointments, or if I have done something or said something. I also developed a really bad
13 anger problem.

14 There have been a number of times throughout my life where I have thought about
15 cutting my wrists, but then I thought better of it. I didn't want to let them win. I have
16 issues with social situations and don't really have much respect for authority.

17 Perhaps the biggest effect, though, has been my ongoing heart problems and the
18 fact that I don't think I can have kids. This was because of the ECT I received at Lake
19 Alice.

20 It has taken the Ministry of Health 35 years to help me out -- to help me with my
21 heart problems, even though it was picked up way back when I was at Lake Alice.

22 I use fishing to calm me down. It is a relaxant and helps me to forget the horrible
23 things I went through, for a little while anyway.

24 I think Selwyn Leeks should be charged. If they brought him back, I'd be the first
25 in the courthouse. Something needs to happen to him. It's just not right.

26 I want proper compensation for what happened to me. The compensation
27 I received is nowhere near enough for 50 years for pain and suffering. In my opinion, they
28 could do a lot better. I have sent an e-mail directly to the Ministry telling them what they
29 paid me out and that it's not right. I haven't got a reply back yet.

30 I received an apology letter from the Ministry, but I still don't think that's good
31 enough for everything that happened. I want a public apology so everyone in New Zealand
32 knows what we went through. No-one knew what was happening to us at that time, and
33 some actually turned a blind eye so they didn't have to face what was happening to us.
34 People need to know that.

1 Ultimately I want some responsibility taken from the Ministry of Health and for
2 them to recognise that it is their systems that caused all of this. The mental health system
3 needs a change in Aotearoa, it needs to be overhauled so that this never happens again.
4 Same with the compensation processes.

5 Lastly, I'm so glad that Lake Alice closed down. But I wish they would get rid of
6 the buildings, get rid of Lake Alice itself. They need a bulldozer put through them,
7 including the fence. I offered to do that for them.

8 Q. Thank you for that, Chaz. Is there anything else that you wanted to say?

9 A. Not at this point.

10 Q. I just wanted to note that you did say in your statement that after you went to the Police
11 Station you closed that chapter of your life, and I just wanted to say thank you for opening
12 it for a short time to us so we could hear your story, I think that was very, very important.

13 Now the Commissioners may have some questions for you.

14 **CHAIR:** Commissioner Alofivae's got a question for you.

15 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Good morning Chaz.

16 A. Good morning.

17 Q. Thank you also for opening up that chapter in your life. I just have a question around when
18 the Police interviewed you recently, presuming you referred them to the complaint you'd
19 made over 20 years ago as well?

20 A. Yeah, I think I did.

21 Q. And going back to that complaint in 1978, was there any follow-up from you about the
22 complaint?

23 A. I might have followed up but they never.

24 Q. So you might have followed it up but they never came back to you?

25 A. No.

26 Q. No acknowledgment?

27 A. None at all.

28 Q. Nothing. And what about with the Citizens Commission on Human Rights, only if you can
29 recall?

30 A. I don't.

31 Q. All right, thank you, thank you very much --

32 A. You're welcome.

33 Q. -- for your courage this morning.

34 **CHAIR:** Chaz, I've got a question, after all this time it might be a bit hard. You mentioned ward

- 1 8 and we've had lots of numbers of different villas and wards. We've heard from other
2 people that ward 8 at their time was actually an adult place, like a lock-up place.
- 3 A. That's right.
- 4 Q. So that was the ward 8 or the villa 8 that you were put into?
- 5 A. Yeah.
- 6 Q. So you were put there with adult patients?
- 7 A. Yeah.
- 8 Q. And they were, as I understand, they were pretty seriously ill, mentally ill?
- 9 A. Mmm.
- 10 Q. And it was a lock-up?
- 11 A. [Nods].
- 12 Q. And you spent some time there?
- 13 A. Roughly about three months, roughly.
- 14 Q. Were there any other young people there with you?
- 15 A. Not that I can recall.
- 16 Q. And it was only after that time that you later went to the Adolescent Unit, is that right?
- 17 A. Yeah.
- 18 Q. Were you given any special or different treatment because you were a young person?
- 19 A. None.
- 20 Q. What was it like being there with those adult patients?
- 21 A. Let's just say I learned things I shouldn't have known about.
- 22 Q. Yeah. Because other survivors have told us that they went there and they got abused and
23 had a bad time.
- 24 A. They wouldn't have been far wrong.
- 25 Q. I won't press you on that point anymore but thank you very much.
- 26 A. You're welcome.
- 27 Q. I'll just leave you with Commissioner Gibson.
- 28 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Thanks Chaz, a couple of questions first. You had some heart
29 issues after some ECT and you had to go to Whanganui Hospital, somewhere else.
- 30 A. That's right.
- 31 Q. Was that the first time to your knowledge that you experienced heart issues?
- 32 A. The first time I knew about it.
- 33 Q. And after that, did you receive anymore ECT?
- 34 A. Yeah.

1 Q. So the staff and everyone knew about the heart issues?

2 A. No.

3 Q. But the ECT continued?

4 A. Mmm. I got ECT for nearly 9, 10 months.

5 Q. And do you know if the heart issues came after that intense period of ECT when you got it
6 six days in a row, or was that before or after then?

7 A. Actually by what I was told by my father I had the heart problem from a very young age,
8 I gathered I was born with it. So I'm picking it would have been in my medical file if
9 anyone bothered to read it, which I don't think they did.

10 Q. And nobody to your knowledge asked you about it or there was no discussion about --

11 A. None at all.

12 Q. Thanks. It's up to me to thank you, Chaz. This is really hard, it takes a lot of courage
13 I know and really appreciate you reading, I know that's important to you. So much that
14 there was discrimination, there was Māori, you were treated like a rag doll. Can I also
15 acknowledge the people that support you, the people that you carry with you today through
16 what you wear, the people that are acknowledged in that way.

17 And also I note, I think you said you were a bit of a hero and I think there was an
18 affirmation from the back of the room here today for that acknowledgment of that, and
19 I hope you know that you're more than just a bit of a hero coming forward now, that the
20 courage and the determination after all these years to bring it up, you and many people like
21 you are national heroes for trying to seek resolution for this and to try and stop what has
22 happened and stop -- make life better for people, for children, for people going through
23 mental health, places in the future.

24 A. I think all most of us want is just justice for what happened.

25 Q. Yeah. And I think -- I hope you get your day in court and be that first person there if that
26 ever happens.

27 A. Wouldn't be the first time I've stood in a courtroom.

28 Q. And it's not the first time you'll be acknowledged as a hero, so again, thank you for being a
29 hero, kia ora. **[Applause]**

30 **CHAIR:** On that note of acclamation we will take the lunch adjournment. There's nothing else to
31 know before we start?

32 **MS A THOMAS:** Ma'am, I just did want to point out that the first exhibit in Mr Symes' statement
33 is a psychiatrist's report dated 10 April 1973 which is before the second Lake Alice
34 admission, which notes his heart condition in that file. So that supports Mr Symes'

1 comment that if they did read the medical file they would be aware of that heart problem.

2 **CHAIR:** That's a very important point. Thank you very much for bringing it to our attention.

3 Thank you.

4 **MS A THOMAS:** Tēnā koe Charlie.

5 **CHAIR:** We'll take the adjournment. [Applause]

6 **Adjournment from 11.42 am to 1.19 pm**

7 **CHAIR:** Good afternoon Mr Molloy.

8 **MR MOLLOY:** Good morning ma'am, we have two witnesses here from the Medical Council,
9 and I'm going to hand over to my colleague.

10 **MS MILLER:** Good afternoon ma'am.

11 **CHAIR:** Good afternoon.

12 **MS MILLER:** My name's Ms Miller and I appear with the witnesses for the Medical Council.

13 **CHAIR:** Welcome, Ms Miller, to the Commission.

14 **MS MILLER:** Thank you.

15 **CHAIR:** We'll start -- I understand that somebody, either of these people wish to make a
16 statement.

17 **MS MILLER:** That's correct.

18 **CHAIR:** But we'll wait for the affirmation and then proceed after that, does that suit you?

19 **MS MILLER:** That would be great, thank you.

20 **ALEYNA MARY HALL, DAVID PETER DUNBAR**

21 **CHAIR:** Good afternoon to Ms Thomas and --

22 **MS MILLER:** It's Ms Hall and Mr --

23 **CHAIR:** Shall I start looking at the right piece of paper, I know perfectly well you're not Ms
24 Thomas, you're Ms Hall and Mr Dunbar, welcome to you both. And I'm going to ask you if
25 you would do a dual affirmation, I'll read it to you and ask you if you would agree. Do you
26 both solemnly, sincerely and truly declare that the evidence you give to the Commission
27 will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth?

28 **MR DUNBAR:** I do.

29 **MS HALL:** I do.

30 **CHAIR:** Thank you. Yes Ms Miller.

31 **MS MILLER:** If Ms Hall could take this opportunity to read the statement on behalf of the
32 Medical Council.

33 **CHAIR:** Perhaps just identify who you are for the record.

34 **QUESTIONING BY MS MILLER:** I can certainly do that ma'am.